

南丫島索罟灣

前南丫石礦場地區

未來土地用途發展規劃及工程研究 - 可行性研究

Agreement No. CE 33/2011 (CE)

Planning and Engineering Study
on Future Land Use at

ex-Lamma
quarry area at

Sok Kwu Wan, Lamma Island
Feasibility Study

Stage 1 Community Engagement Report

March 2014



Contents

	Page
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Background	1
1.2 Study Programme	1
1.3 Purpose and Structure of this Report	2
2 Community Engagement Activities	3
2.1 Briefings to Statutory and Advisory Bodies	3
2.2 Focus Group Meetings	5
2.3 Workshop and Forums	7
2.4 Roving Exhibitions	8
2.5 Written Comments Received	8
3 Summary of Key Comments and Responses	9
3.1 Guiding Principles and Objectives	9
3.2 Development Themes	12
3.3 Planning and Design Concepts	15
3.4 Development Scale	18
3.5 Land Use and Facilities	19
3.6 Accessibility	24
3.7 Environmental and Ecological Impacts	26
3.8 Others	28
4 Way Forward	30

Appendices

- Appendix 1 List of Stage 1 Community Engagement Activities
- Appendix 2 Minutes of the Town Planning Board Meeting (Extracted)
- Appendix 3 Minutes of Islands District Council Meeting (Extracted)
- Appendix 4 Gist of Major Comments from the meeting with Lamma (South) Rural Committee
- Appendix 5 Minutes of Legislative Council Panel on Development (Extracted)
- Appendix 6 Minutes of Land and Development Advisory Committee (Planning Sub-committee) Meeting
- Appendix 7 Minutes of Southern District Council Meeting (Extracted)
- Appendix 8 Gist of Major Comments from the meeting with Lamma (North) Rural Committee
- Appendix 9 Gist of Major Comments from the Focus Group Meeting with Green Groups, Professional Institutes and Concerned Parties
- Appendix 10 Gist of Major Comments from the Focus Group Meeting with Tourism and Hotel Industry
- Appendix 11 Gist of Major Comments from the Community Workshop
- Appendix 12 Gist of Major Comments from the Community Forum
- Appendix 13 Gist of Major Comments from the Public Forum
- Appendix 14 List of Commenters
- Appendix 15 Photos of Stage 1 Community Engagement Activities

1 Introduction

1.1 Background

Civil Engineering and Development Department (CEDD) and Planning Department (PlanD) of the HKSAR Government (Government) commissioned Ove Arup and Partners Hong Kong Limited (Arup) on 30 January 2012 to undertake the “Planning and Engineering Study on Future Land Use at Ex-Lamma Quarry Area at Sok Kwu Wan, Lamma Island – Feasibility Study” (Study). The Study will explore the development potential of the Ex-Lamma Quarry area (ELQ/ Study Site), including residential use with compatible developments, and the impacts of the proposed developments on the surrounding areas (Study Area).

Located on the northern coast of Sok Kwu Wan, the ELQ was established in 1978 for rock excavation and miscellaneous processing and storage. After years of operation, it was left with steep rock faces, which scarred the natural landscape around the area. The “Rehabilitation of Lamma Quarry Planning and Engineering Study” (Rehabilitation Study) was commissioned and rehabilitation works were completed in 2002. The works included the formation of a series of broad, gentle sloping platforms, the formation of a 5-hectare man-made lake, as well as the landscaping and planting of exotic and native trees. At present, the ELQ comprises 20 hectares of platform area and 1 kilometre of shoreline, and has the potential to incorporate different compatible land uses. The Study Site has been placed under Short Term Tenancy (STT) to a non-governmental organization (NGO) for an environmental education and wild life learning centre.

The Study Site is currently zoned “Undetermined” (“U”) on the Lamma Island Outline Zoning Plan (OZP) pending detailed consideration of the potential development uses. In light of the size and visually prominent location of the site, it is particularly stated in the Explanatory Statement of the OZP that public views should be sought on any future major development within the Study Site.

1.2 Study Programme

After conducting baseline review and establishing the guiding principles, the Initial Land Use Options (Initial Options) were formulated for Stage 1 Community Engagement (CE) and assessments for technical feasibility. Findings from the Stage 1 CE and technical assessments will be incorporated into the finalization phase of the Recommended Outline Development Plan (RODP) for refinement.

A two-stage CE has been adopted throughout the Study to foster consensus building through exchange of views in an open and informed process. With the aim to engage the public in formulating the future development plans for the ELQ, the public recognition of the outcome for the Study would be enhanced:-

- Stage 1: To solicit views and ideas of the public on the Initial Options on future land use, with a view to assessing the general acceptability of these options;

- Stage 2: To solicit public views on the draft RODP to obtain feedback for further refinement.

The two-month Stage 1 CE took place between 7 December 2012 and 6 February 2013. To facilitate public discussion, the Stage 1 CE Digest and other publicity materials including leaflets and posters covering the Study's background, a brief account of the key issues/ opportunities, along with the Initial Options for the Study Site were disseminated to the public for general reference. At the same time, a Study website (<http://www.ex-lammaquarry.hk>) was launched to facilitate easy public access to relevant publicity and consultation materials, details of the CE activities, summary of Preliminary Feasibility Assessments, as well as the latest progress of the Study.

In order to solicit views and suggestions from different sectors of the community, a series of CE activities including briefing sessions/ focus group meetings, a community workshop as well as community and public forums were conducted. A list of CE activities is attached in **Appendix 1**.

1.3 Purpose and Structure of this Report

The purpose of this Report is to summarise the public comments and suggestions received during the Stage 1 CE and to provide responses to these comments and suggestions. The received comments and suggestions have been analysed and duly considered. However, as the Study is still in progress, some of the comments/ suggestions will require further investigation. After extensive analysis and full consideration, appropriate specific concepts or recommendations have been incorporated into draft RODP and Layout Plans in the next stage.

The report mainly covers the following sections:

- Chapter 1: Background of the Study and Stage 1 Community Engagement Programme;
- Chapter 2: Overview of Community Engagement activities;
- Chapter 3: Summary of key comments and responses; and
- Chapter 4: Way forward.

2 Community Engagement Activities

2.1 Briefings to Statutory and Advisory Bodies

During the CE period, briefing sessions were conducted for various statutory and advisory bodies. The purpose of these briefing sessions was to solicit the views and suggestions from relevant authorities on the Initial Options for the ELQ. The list of consulted parties and dates of the activities are recorded in **Appendix 1**.

2.1.1 Town Planning Board

The Town Planning Board (TPB) meeting was held on 14 December 2012. Detailed comments were recorded in the minutes in **Appendix 2**. Members shared their views on the consultation materials, planning objectives, integration of the local character into the new developments, planning concepts, development intensities, transport infrastructure provision and potential adverse impacts.

Some members suggested that the suitability of proposed residential development should take into account the local characters of Lamma Island and concerns from the local residents. The proposed 12-storey buildings were considered to be excessive in height and that future development should be mixed well with the existing characters of Lamma Island. Given the scenic views and unique local characters of Lamma Island, members suggested that the Study Site would be suitable for recreational, leisure and tourism uses to attract more visitors and provide local job opportunities. Ferry services should be affordable and financially sustainable to meet the traffic needs. Since the existing woodland mainly consists of single species, more varieties of native trees should be introduced to enhance biodiversity during the development process.

2.1.2 Islands District Council

The Islands District Council was consulted on 17 December 2012. Detailed comments were recorded in the minutes in **Appendix 3**. Members supported the proposed development at the Study Site and urged for its early implementation. The proposed housing development was generally supported; however, members suggested that Public Rental Housing (PRH) would not be suitable at the Study Site but that future development should be affordable for all. The characteristics of Lamma Island should be preserved and public spaces could be enjoyed by the general public. Members also suggested that, by developing the Study Site, it was expected to enhance local community facilities, such as medical services on Lamma Island. Extensive public engagement with the local residents, green groups and Rural Committees was also suggested and a balance between development and preservation should be maintained.

2.1.3 Lamma (South) Rural Committee

The meeting with Lamma (South) Rural Committee was held on 27 December 2012. Major comments were summarised in the gist in **Appendix 4**. Members supported the proposed development at the Study Site including housing

development and subsidised housing at the Study Site. Members opined that future development should benefit local residents and retain the local characters of Lamma Island as the “back garden” of Hong Kong. The proposed marina was not supported as it would affect the fishing industry in Sok Kwu Wan. Members supported the proposed connection from the Study Site to Lo So Shing to serve the future development. They also opined the formulation of overall planning direction before determining the future land uses of the Study Site and that the natural ecology near to the power plant has been destroyed and could be used for development.

2.1.4 Legislative Council Panel on Development

Legislative Council Panel on Development was consulted on 22 January 2013. Detailed comments were recorded in the minutes in **Appendix 5**. Members suggested that the development of the Study Site should be examined in the wider context of Lamma Island. They expressed that no luxury flats and marina development would be needed while some members doubted whether PRH should be provided on Lamma Island, particularly on the traffic issues. They suggested that various issues such as connectivity, community facilities and employment opportunities should be carefully considered for the additional population intake.

Members requested to capitalize on local ecological and cultural characters for eco-tourism development, and also suggested the development of tourism, leisure facilities and housing. For example, proposed leisure facilities and water sports centre in the housing option can be simultaneously developed along with the housing development. It was suggested that new developments should be compatible and integrate with the local characters. A member suggested the conversion of the Study Site into ecological park or country park. Other members stressed that the transportation linkage between the Study Site and Hong Kong Island must be enhanced with adequate capacity to accommodate future traffic needs. Some further suggested the Government to explore the feasibility of constructing a tunnel to connect Lamma Island and Hong Kong Island in the long term. A member suggested that the impacts of the proposed developments on the livelihood of existing residents should be examined.

2.1.5 Land and Development Advisory Committee (Planning Sub-committee)

The Planning Sub-Committee of the Land and Development Advisory Committee (LDAC) was consulted on 30 January 2013. Detailed comments were recorded in the minutes in **Appendix 6**. Some members supported residential development at the Study Site to meet the imminent housing need, and suggested to increase the development intensity and consider reclamation to enhance housing supply. However, some suggested that public housing or mass housing was not suitable due to a number of site constraints. The proposed residential flats with flat size 50 – 100 square meters might neither be appropriate for subsidised nor high-end housings. The developments of resort hotels, tourism and recreational facilities at the Study Site were supported. Other beneficial uses such as Government, Institution or Community (G/IC) facilities and commercial uses were suggested.

Some members remarked that transport linkages to Hong Kong Island would be a key to overcome the development constraints and the future development should be integrated with the existing developments in Sok Kwu Wan. They were concerned about the future management of the proposed public recreational uses, water quality of the man-made lake and impacts of marina development on adjoining fish cultural zones.

2.1.6 Southern District Council

The District Development and Environment Committee of Southern District Council was consulted on 4 February 2013. Detailed comments were recorded in the minutes in **Appendix 7**. The Committee noted the strong support for the proposed development from the Islands District Council and agreed with the need for development of Lamma Island. Members were concerned about the traffic impact of the future development at the Study Site to Aberdeen and Ap Lei Chau. They urged that the traffic conditions at Aberdeen and Ap Lei Chau should be assessed to ensure that there would be no adverse traffic impact in the Southern District resulted from the proposed development.

Some members concerned that the building heights of the proposed development at the Study Site would adversely affect the low-rise lifestyle and natural landscape setting of Lamma. They also worried that the Study Site would not be affordable and accessible by the general public after development. There were some suggestions to investigate the feasibility of relocating a university institution from urban area to the Study Site to release the original land for other types of development, as well as other land uses at the Study Site.

2.1.7 Lamma (North) Rural Committee

The meeting with Lamma (North) Rural Committee was held on 20 February 2013. Major comments were summarised in the gist of comments in **Appendix 8**. Members generally supported the development at the Study Site because the Study Site is an ex-quarry site rather than natural environment. They considered that the Study Site should be developed with suitable density with a mix of private and subsidised housing and other facilities. They stressed that the development at the Study Site should not be developed by a single developer. Members supported tourism development on Lamma Island, and suggested that the man-made lake should be used for landscaping purpose for the enjoyment of young generation. However, they did not support the proposed marina as Sok Kwu Wan was considered not suitable for boat berthing and it would affect the existing fish culture activities.

2.2 Focus Group Meetings

During the CE period, two focus group meetings were conducted with green groups, professional institutes, concerned parties, and tourism and hotel industry to solicit professional and in-depth views from the relevant stakeholders. The list of focus group meetings and dates of the activities is recorded in **Appendix 1**.

2.2.1 Green Groups, Professional Institutes and Concerned Parties

A Focus Group Meeting with green groups, professional institutes and concerned parties was held on 6 February 2013. A total of 18 representatives from green groups (Association for Geoconservation Hong Kong, Living Lamma, South Lamma Concern Group and LINC), professional institutes (the Hong Kong Institute of Surveyors, Hong Kong Institute of Planners, Hong Kong Institute of Urban Design and the Hong Kong Institute of Landscape Architects) and some local NGOs (Mo Tat Community, St. James' Settlement, Lamma-zine, YMCA of Hong Kong) participated in the meeting.

In-depth discussions mainly focusing on ecological and environmental impacts of the proposed development at the Study Site were carried out. In general, participants considered that the proposed residential development would not be viable and could not meet the territorial housing demand since it could neither provide luxury houses nor affordable housing. They suggested that other land use options such as sports, recreation, tourism and eco-education uses should be considered, including a world-class theme park providing leisure and educational facilities, as well as utilizing the history of ELQ as a tourism attraction. Some of the participants suggested that various entertainment uses such as water sports, research and educational institutions, marine ecology and fisheries-related uses could be considered. With regards to the proposed marina development, some of the participants considered the proposal infeasible and impractical, and that would cause marine safety issue. Participants were also of the view that the planning intention of car-free environment was visionary, and they were concerned about the ecological, environmental and social impacts of the proposed development in the Initial Options. They suggested that the strategic planning context of Lamma Island should be considered to meet the need and aspirations of the local community. Major comments were summarised in the gist of comments in **Appendix 9**.

2.2.2 Tourism and Hotel Industry

Another Focus Group Meeting with tourism and hotel industry was held on 4 March 2013. Representatives from Hong Kong Tourism Board and Hong Kong Ecotourism Society attended the meeting. Participants agreed that the increase in hotel rooms can cater for the needs of different types of visitors. Some suggested that high-end and themed hotels would be more commercially viable and would have resources to promote sustainable tourism development. Some others considered that affordable hotels should be provided and worried that resort hotels would affect the local characters of the area. They suggested that rock quarry, fishing culture, seafood restaurants and natural environment were important local characters which tourism development could capitalise on. In addition, they pointed out that traffic is the key consideration for hotel development on the outlying island. Designated piers/ landing steps should be provided at the location of hotel development and urban areas. Major comments were summarised in the gist of comments in **Appendix 10**.

2.3 Workshop and Forums

In order to collect feedback directly from the local community and general public on the Study, three CE activities namely Community Workshop, Community Forum and Public Forum were held during the Stage 1 CE. The list of locations and dates of these CE activities is recorded in **Appendix 1**.

2.3.1 Community Workshop

A Community Workshop was held at the open area outside Tin Hau Temple in Sok Kwu Wan on 5 January 2013. About 80 participants, including local residents and representatives of local villages, Lamma (South) Rural Committee members, local concern groups, NGOs, local seafood restaurants and ferry service operators, attended the Community Workshop. Group discussions were held to discuss on the theme of future development, target population and intensity of future development, proposed land uses and facilities, and connectivity of the Study Site etc. Representatives from each group shared their views in the reporting session after group discussions. Major comments were summarised in the gist of comments in **Appendix 11**. Photos of the Community Workshop can be found in **Appendix 16**.

2.3.2 Community Forum

A Community Forum was held at Northern Lamma School in Yung Shue Wan on 12 January 2013. About 80 participants, who were mainly local residents, District Councillors, and representatives of local concern groups and NGOs, attended the Community Forum. After the presentation of the Study findings and Initial Options, a question-and-answer session was carried out to allow exchange of views and ideas between participants, representatives of CEDD and PlanD, as well as the Study Consultants on the establishment of guiding principles, availability of baseline and technical information, theme for the future development, population and development intensity of future development, proposed land uses and facilities in Initial Options, and connectivity of the Study Site etc. Major comments were summarised in the gist of comments in **Appendix 12**. Photos of the Community Forum can be found in **Appendix 16**.

2.3.3 Public Forum

A Public Forum was held at City Gallery in Central on 19 January 2013. About 80 participants, including local residents of Lamma Island, academics, representatives of Lamma (South) Rural Committee, local concern groups, green groups, NGOs and professional institutes attended the Public Forum. Similar to the Community Forum, after the presentation of the Study findings and Initial Options, a question-and-answer session was carried out to allow exchange of views and ideas between participants, representatives of CEDD and PlanD, as well as the Study Consultants on the theme for future development, design and ecological impacts of future development, availability of technical details of the Study, facilities and land uses of future development, and connectivity of the

Study Site etc. Major comments were summarised in the gist of comments in **Appendix 13**. Photos of the Public Forum can be found in **Appendix 16**.

2.4 Roving Exhibitions

Roving Exhibitions with panel displays were held at five locations including Sok Kwu Wan Ferry Pier, Yung Shue Wan Ferry Pier, Aberdeen Promenade, Central Pier No. 4, and the Harbour Building in Central to inform the public of the Initial Options for the ELQ. The list of locations and dates of roving exhibition activities is recorded in **Appendix 1**.

2.5 Written Comments Received

During the Stage 1 CE, a total of 523 written comments were received through email, fax, letters and comment forms. The submissions came from various sectors of the community, including local residents, Rural Committees, green groups, local concern groups and individuals. Their views and suggestions were duly considered and had been taken into account in the Study as appropriate. A list of commenters is attached as **Appendix 14**. All written submissions were also uploaded to the Study website (<http://www.ex-lammaquarry.hk>) for public inspection and viewing.

3 Summary of Key Comments and Responses

3.1 Guiding Principles and Objectives

Need for Development

There were general supporting views that the Study Site should be developed, especially from Islands District Council, Lamma (South) and Lamma (North) Rural Committees, LDAC, and many members of the public. Some members of the public considered future development at the Study Site would benefit local economy and community in Sok Kwu Wan, while building a new attraction for tourists. Some members of the public also questioned why housing was a prerequisite for all Initial Options without justifications for housing demand on Lamma Island.

Response

To meet future economic and social development needs of Hong Kong, the HKSAR Government has strived to increase land supply. Being the closest outlying island to the urban area, the ELQ has been considered to be a potential site for enhancing land supply for housing development. The Study Site is located on the government land, thus allowing expeditious implementation without large-scale private land resumption. The Study Site will not only offer different types of housing choices to help alleviate the imminent housing needs of Hong Kong, but also provide a considerable amount of land for provision of a wide range of uses including community, recreational and tourism facilities that would benefit local economy and community in Sok Kwu Wan, while building a new attraction for tourists.

Preservation of Local Characters

Many members of the public remarked that Lamma Island is the “back garden” of Hong Kong and a popular destination for tourism and leisure activities. Some members of the public, TPB, Lamma (South) Rural Committee, LDAC and Islands and Southern District Councils suggested that future development should be preserved and be mixed well with the local characters of Lamma Island. However, some members of the public were of the view that the Initial Options ignored the current characteristics of the island and did not provide any alternative options for public enjoyment.

Response

The planning of the Study Site has taken full account of the local characters of Lamma Island and the quarry site, through preserving its landscape and resources, providing housing and ancillary facilities on the 20-hectare platform, as well as enhancing its tourism appeal and leisure character. The existing natural and rehabilitated vegetation have been preserved as far as possible. Comprehensive landscape framework is proposed to integrate the Study Site with quality public spaces and ample green space to blend in with the island setting. The visual

connection to the natural backdrop of the Study Site from major vantage points includes existing settlements at Sok Kwu Wan would be preserved. A stepped building height profile descending towards the waterfront has also been adopted to create visual harmony with its waterfront setting and the existing rural settlements.

By capitalizing on the unique island setting and local characters, the proposed development at the Study Site would enhance the tourism appeal and leisure character of Lamma Island for public enjoyment. The local character of active shop frontages would also be retained as part of the proposed commercial area as an anchor point for enhancing tourism appeal. The unique man-made lake would be preserved fully at the Study Site to retain the existing unique landscape and for water recreation and tourism related activities.

Sustainable Development

Many members of the public and LDAC agreed to the concept of sustainable community for future development at the Study Site. Members of the Islands District Council stressed that the need for development and environmental conservation should be balanced. While noting that the Study mentions sustainable development, some members of the public were of the view that the environmental aspects appear to be lacking.

Response

Sustainable development is one of the major considerations in the planning of future land uses at the Study Site. During the planning process, careful consideration has been given to achieve a balancing act between development and conservation. The Study Team has conducted baseline review and ecological surveys of the Study Area. The “Coastal Protection Area”, existing natural and rehabilitated vegetation and the man-made lake within the Study Area would be retained as far as possible from conservation and landscape perspectives.

We recognise the public aspiration for sustainable development, and thus the Study has put emphasis on creating a quality living environment. The proposed ferry pier for the Study Site will be centrally located to minimise walking distances between the pier and various parts of the Study Site. Considering the short distance among various developments and their proximity to the proposed ferry pier, comprehensive pedestrian and cycle track networks will be provided to promote walking and cycling as major transport modes within the Study Site. View corridors and breezeways are incorporated to protect visual amenity and enhance air ventilation. A robust landscape framework is proposed to increase greening to blend in with the rural setting. Other green initiatives are proposed such as encouraging the use of environmentally friendly transport mode and waste recycling facilities.

The Study is a designated project under the Environmental Impact Assessment Ordinance (EIAO) and the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) will be undertaken at a later stage of the Study. The environmental acceptability of the draft RODP is subject to a number of assessments in terms of air quality, water quality, ecology and fisheries, noise, waste, land contamination, cultural heritage,

landscape and visual, etc. according to the EIA Study Brief. An evaluation of the sustainability implications of Initial Options had also been carried out using the latest Computer-Aided Sustainability Evaluation Tool (CASET) in addition to other technical assessments.

Need for Strategic Planning

Many members of the public, local concern groups and professional institutes stressed the need to consider the strategic planning context of Lamma Island in the study when formulating the Initial Options. Members of the professional institutes were of the view that the visions and guiding principles of the Study appear to be significantly lacking in terms of the potential roles of Lamma as a whole in the bigger picture or territorial context. An overall planning analysis including tourism development, ecological and heritage conservation, and opportunities and constraints of the Study Site was needed. Some members of the public worried that the existing infrastructure on Lamma Island might not be able to support the proposed development.

Response

A number of strategic, territorial, regional and local planning studies relevant to the Study Area were reviewed. It has been identified that the ELQ is suitable for recreational use whilst other uses, including residential and other compatible uses, should not be precluded. The planning of the ELQ has taken into account the existing and future developments in the surrounding areas and the future infrastructure projects. To enhance local tourism and create synergy with nearby tourist developments on Lamma Island and Southern District, provision of a wide range of tourism related facilities, such as Outdoor Recreation Centre, Water Sports Centre, waterfront promenade, commercial area and hotel development, accompanied by low to medium housing developments have been proposed. The planning of the ELQ will capitalise on its uniqueness and geographical advantages on the strategic context of Lamma Island. It will not only perform its own functions but also complement and strengthen integration with surrounding areas.

Compliance with the Planning Intention

Many members of the public considered that future development at the Study Site should adhere to planning intention of Lamma Island as stated in the OZP. Some members of the public worried that the proposed development will create an undesirable precedent for other future large scale developments which may diminish the existing local businesses on the island.

Response

The proposed development at ELQ is in line with the planning intention of Lamma Island as a whole. Due respect has been paid to the existing characters of Lamma Island, including the natural landscape and car-free environment. The rich natural and landscape resources including the hillslopes with dense vegetation, man-made lake and shorelines have been respected and integrated with the land use proposals. With the goal to create a quality living environment with healthy

and leisurely lifestyle emphasised, it is recommended that cycling and walking be prioritised and environmentally friendly transport mode as an ancillary service.

Moreover, embedded with rich ecological, historical and landscape characters, and coupled with the famous seafood restaurants and fishermen villages at Sok Kwu Wan, the Study Site together with the existing Sok Kwu Wan settlement will distinguish itself as a destination and weekend getaway for visitors. The Study Site, with its tranquil seaside location in rural island setting, the large man-made lake and proximity to the urban area, has potentials for accommodating a wide range of leisure and tourism activities. Retail and food and beverage uses in building not exceeding 2 storeys at the Lamma Hub at the entrance of the proposed pier will create a vibrant and welcoming public gathering space to retain the rural and leisure character of Lamma Island. These commercial spaces will blend in with the existing local character of Lamma and become one of the tourist attractions at ELQ. They will support local economies development and provide job opportunities for the local community.

3.2 Development Themes

Housing Theme

Some members of the public, Islands and Southern District Councils, Lamma (South) and Lamma (North) Rural Committees and LDAC supported housing development at the Study Site to meet the imminent housing need of Hong Kong and add vibrancy to the area. Many members of the public, Islands District Council and a green group stressed that housing development at the Study Site should be affordable.

However, some members of public and LDAC considered that the proposed residential development in the Initial Options would not be able to accommodate the housing needs of people of different classes. Other land uses in addition to housing should be explored. Many members of the public saw the proposals as a single housing option and requested alternative options without housing should be considered.

Response

As reiterated, the ELQ site has the potential for enhancing land supply for housing development. Other than a tiny part of the land at the south-western platform proposed for the “O” zone, the proposed developments at the Study Site does not involve private land resumption and thus allows the opportunities for expediting the development programme to meet future economic and social development needs of Hong Kong. The proposed ‘Tourism plus Housing’ Option was welcomed by the majority. Different types of housing, including private and subsidised housing in the form of Home Ownership Scheme (HOS) are proposed at the Study Site. In the draft RODP, there will be approximately 37% of housing units dedicated for subsidised housing for Hong Kong residents while the remaining 63% will be for private residential units. In particular, around 1,200 private housing flats and around 700 HOS flats are proposed within the Study Site.

Tourism Theme

Majority of the comments received supported the ‘Tourism plus Housing’ Option. Many members of the public, TPB, LDAC, tourism and hotel industry, Lamma (North) Rural Committee and professional institutes supported tourism development at the Study Site for the enhancement of local employment and economy. It was also stated that tourism development was sustainable as it would generate less traffic as compared to daily commuting pattern.

Given the scenic and unique characters of the Study Site, members of the public and TPB considered that the Study Site would have potentials for tourism development. Many members of the public, local concern groups and tourism and hotel industry pointed out that eco-tourism was popular on Lamma Island where local characters and natural assets should be maintained to promote sustainable eco-tourism. An NGO also suggested that the Study Site could be developed into a tourist spot where education on geology could be carried out. In view of the rich tourism resources in the vicinity of the Study Site, members of professional institutes and LDAC suggested that the synergy with nearby tourism attractions should be explored.

Response

Taking into account the unique island setting of ELQ, a wide range of tourism facilities have been duly incorporated during the formulation of the draft RODP. Tourism related uses including a hotel development, tourist attractions and other supporting facilities like Tourist Information Centre are proposed to enhance the tourism development potential of the Study Site and bring in more economic activities to the area. In addition, in the draft RODP, both the proposed Outdoor Recreation Centre and Water Sports Centre could be potential tourist attractions as well. Together with other surrounding tourist attractions on Lamma Island, the Study Site would become an anchor point and attractive place for visitors.

In addition, a commercial area is designated in the Entrance Plaza (Lamma Hub) to further enhance the vibrancy of the area. The Lamma Hub would be of low-rise and low density with active shop frontages to retain the existing active frontage character and local business on Lamma Island.

Recreational and Eco-Educational Themes

Many members of the public and TPB suggested that recreational and leisure uses were suitable at the Study Site given its scenic view and unique characters. Some members of the public suggested the creation of an eco-park dedicated to sustainable living together with the existing culture of Lamma, allowing for an alternative way of living in the natural environment and providing a new tourist attraction for Hong Kong. It was suggested that the Study Site could be used for ecological and environmental education and served as a weekend getaway destination, with reference to the Eden Project in the United Kingdom or existing outdoor centre operation of YMCA of Hong Kong at the Study Site.

Response

During the formulation of the draft RODP, due consideration has been given to incorporating particular elements from the suggestions received. Taking into account planning circumstances, strategic positioning, land use compatibility, engineering feasibility, cost and implementation etc., the draft RODP has incorporated a wide range of recreational and eco-educational facilities. In the Initial Options, a sizeable area of land was dedicated for leisure and tourism facilities, including the Eco-tourism Centre and the Water Sports Centre. In the draft RODP, the Water Sports Centre is proposed to offer a number of water-based recreational facilities which will act in conjunction with the man-made lake to create an active recreational environment. An Outdoor Recreation Centre is also proposed to meet the community needs for sports and recreational facilities. A wide range of recreational facilities including the woodland park, lakeside park, man-made lake, waterfront promenade, cycling tracks have been included in the draft RODP to provide leisure and recreational spaces for public enjoyment. There are also retail and dining facilities which serve as a vibrant commercial area and large public areas for festive events.

In the draft RODP, a Community Health Centre cum Tourist Information Centre is proposed. Eco-tourism and educational activities can be potentially provided in the Tourist Information Centre. Hiking paths connecting the Study Site and surrounding areas including Yung Shue Wan and Sok Kwu Wan would also be provided to enhance the accessibility as well as facilitate eco-tourism development at the Study Site to synchronise with the surrounding eco-tourism resources.

Other Development Themes

Some members of the public recommended utilizing the opportunities of developing the ex-quarry for re-planning and relocating old existing villages, retaining the existing building height while constructing modern village houses. Some members of Southern District Council suggested that other land uses including university, convention centre or casino might also be considered. Some members of a professional institute and LDAC suggested that other beneficial uses other than housing could be considered at the Study Site. The professional institute also suggested that some G/IC facilities in the urban area could be relocated to the Study Site so as to release their original site in the urban area for development.

Response

We understand the community aspirations for other development themes in the Study Site. In light of the imminent needs for housing provision in the territory, the ELQ has been identified as a potential site for enhancing land supply for housing development as previously mentioned. Along with the housing development theme, other development themes including tourism, recreational and eco-educational etc. have been explored and duly incorporated in the draft RODP. During the formulation of the draft RODP, due respect has been paid to the existing characters of Lamma Island, including the natural landscape, local

culture, rural settlement and car-free environment. The existing village in Sok Kwu Wan will be retained to preserve the unique rural living style of the island.

3.3 Planning and Design Concepts

3.3.1 Planning Concepts

Integration with Local Community

Many members of the public considered that future development at the Study Site should improve the transport infrastructure and community facilities in Sok Kwu Wan so that local residents could be benefited. They also stressed the importance of connectivity with existing local community so that future development at the Study Site would not be isolated. Members of LDAC suggested that future development at the Study Site should integrate with existing development in Sok Kwu Wan. Islands District Council suggested that tourism and other business in future development at the Study Site should allow local residents to participate. There was also a suggestion received to consider conducting social impact assessment for the proposed development to examine the impacts on the existing residents.

Response

In order to enhance the accessibility to the Study Site, it has been proposed to possibly enhance the existing ferry service from Sok Kwu Wan to Central. A new pier is proposed for new boarding location for existing ferry services operated between Central/ Aberdeen and the existing Sok Kwu Wan Pier.

To complement with the population growth, a site has been reserved at the central part of the Study Site for community facilities such as a public library and social welfare facilities and a police post. Another site in the central portion is also designated for the Community Health Centre cum Tourist Information Centre. Other facilities such as a fire station, a refuse collection point, refuse transfer facilities and sewage treatment works are also located in the north-eastern corner of the Study Site. These facilities will serve the needs of the local community. A sustainability assessment which uses CASET as evaluation framework and includes the assessment on the implications on the local community as well as to Hong Kong at large would be undertaken for the draft RODP.

Affordable and Accessible for Public

Many members of the public, Islands and Southern District Council and Lamma (North) Rural Committee stressed that future development should not be monopolised by a few developers. They worried that the Study Site would cater for luxurious housing development, and suggested that future development should be affordable and accessible by all so that it could benefit local community and economy. Some members of the public further pointed out that no chain stores or large supermarkets are currently present on the island. They stated that the local businesses operated in the form of small shops should be allowed, making Lamma

an attraction for public to experience the unique environment in Hong Kong. They were concerned about the impacts of new developments on the existing local businesses on the island.

Some members of the public considered the Initial Options similar to the private comprehensive housing proposal “Baroque on Lamma”, which was not compatible with the rural character of Lamma Island. They were worried about the potential impacts on the traditional way of living and questioned how the development would benefit the existing community on Lamma. A few members of the public also mentioned that they did not want the island to be turned into a noisy tourist centre and a theme park.

Response

Taking into account the public comments and after detailed reviews, it is planned to provide different types of residential developments for different classes of people in the society to reside in the Study Site. Both subsidised and private housing have been proposed and subsidised housing in the form of HOS would be developed by Housing Authority. In addition, the proposed housing developments would be of various plot ratios, building heights and site areas. By this, a variety of housing choices can be provided for the community.

In addition, the unique island setting of Lamma Island has been taken full account in the formulation of draft RODP. In view of the unique character of local businesses on Lamma Island, we propose the Lamma Hub and the bazaar-style commercial area surrounding the Entrance Plaza. These commercial spaces are envisioned to be developed in the form of low-rise and low density to retain the existing active frontage character on Lamma Island. Not only can they retain the local characters on the island, they also support local economies and provide job opportunities for the local community.

Car-free Environment

Many members of the public stressed that the planning intention of creating a car-free environment on Lamma Island should be retained and therefore future development should create a walkable community. Some members of the public worried that the proposed development might affect the existing car-free setting on Lamma Island.

Response

Walking and cycling will be promoted as the main transport modes within the Study Site, supplemented by environmentally friendly transport mode as an ancillary service, subject to future development. In addition, the Study Site is mainly connected to the urban areas by ferry.

3.3.2 Design Concepts

Many members of the public considered that the building height should be compatible with local characters and the existing environment on Lamma Island. Some members of the public, Southern District Council, TPB were of views that

the proposed building heights of 12 storeys were too excessive and worried that the high-rise development would be an undesirable precedent for future development. High-rise development might also generate traffic for emergency purposes, affecting the car-free environment on Lamma Island. Some members of the public advocated for 3-storey buildings to tally with the height of existing village houses to maintain local characters.

Some members of the public and LDAC supported the stepped building height design and agreed that the views to natural ridgeline with high visual permeability should be protected. Some professional institutes suggested that the landscape, visual character and natural resources at the Study Site should be assessed and preserved. Some members of TPB and a NGO reminded the strong wind from the east and that the Study Site might be vulnerable to typhoon and that proper design measures should be adopted. Some members of the public mentioned that a detailed layout plan other than a survey of existing ground structures was missing. They were of the view that the proposed zoning plan was a mere broad land use plan and lacked any substantive details. Some members of the public were concerned with the aesthetic qualities of future development and requested for building designs that fit the current style.

Response

The concerns on the proposed building heights in view of the planning intention and local characters of the island have been duly considered in the formulation of the draft RODP. Having considered the site context and the rural character, a maximum building height 50 metres above the Principal Datum (mPD) is proposed. The view to the natural ridgeline will be respected through the imposition of stepped building height designs. Low-rise buildings will be placed at the waterfront and relatively taller buildings towards the hillslopes. The stepped profile ensures that the building volumes will follow and respect the natural backdrop, while creating a more interesting and human-scale arrangement of towers. In particular, building height restrictions have been specifically arranged and so that future development would not breach the ridgeline of the mountainous backdrop from major vantage points in the surrounding Sok Kwu Wan Bay, such as the Sok Kwu Wan ferry pier.

The landscape resources and visual characters of the Study Site have also been preliminarily assessed. Preservation of the man-made lake and limiting development upon the flat platform areas to reduce the felling of trees and to avoid development upon the natural coastline had been taken into strong consideration throughout the Study process. Views to the natural ridgeline and major visual corridors have also been preserved. These elements are considered to be the major landscape and visual resources of the Study Site.

Based on the Site Wind Availability Study, the high wind speed of 13.8m/s or above would occupy about 10% in annual wind condition and less than 5% under summer wind condition. The Air Ventilation Assessment (AVA) Initial Study was conducted to assess the ventilation performance of the proposed development. This AVA study demonstrated that the land use proposals would not have major wind problem under both annual and summer non-typhoon wind conditions. Only two areas, including the Coastal Protection Area at the east of the Study Area and

the open space between the man-made lake and the seashore, are identified with relatively high wind velocity under the annual averaged wind speed condition. The vulnerability of the Study Site to typhoon is expected to be similar to other areas with similar site contexts in Hong Kong. Further consideration on typhoon winds can be given to wind load and façade pressure of future buildings at the building design stage.

In the previous stage, three Initial Options under two development themes had been presented with reference to the baseline review. Detailed descriptions together with illustrative materials have been provided to illustrate the land use plans, urban design and landscape frameworks, marine matters and vehicular and pedestrian circulation networks plans for the Initial Options. In the next stage, the draft RODP and illustrative materials such as artist impressions and digital 3D models and animations would be prepared to show the design in more details including the development parameters, building height and building disposition, building blocks and form etc.

3.4 Development Scale

3.4.1 Planned Population and Development Intensity

Some members of the public and Islands District Council supported the increase of population at the Study Site. Lamma (North) and (South) Rural Committees supported the Study Site be developed with suitable density. However, some members of the public considered that the proposed density of development was too high and not compatible with rural characters of Lamma Island. Many members of the public, Lamma (South) Rural Committee, Southern District Council and a NGO worried that the increase in population might affect the lifestyle of the local and nearby community as well as other potential impacts. Many of the responses received considered that the population of 7,000 in Initial Option 1b to be excessive while a population of 5,000 to be acceptable. Some members of the public and Lamma (South) Rural Committee supported the Initial Option 2 with a population of 2,800. A few members of the public even requested an additional population of 100 only or no additional population intake at all.

Citing Tung Chung as a counter example, members of Islands District Council reminded that, livelihood, internal and external connectivity and local employment of local residents should be planned and assessed in the future development. Given the self-contained entity of the Study Site, members of LDAC considered that future development intensity would be dependent on population threshold supported by infrastructure capacities and transport linkages.

Response

In order to preserve the unique rural living style of Lamma Island and to sustain the development intensity in the proposed development, the planned population for the Study Site would not be maximised and the scale of the housing development would be modest. Apart from meeting the economic and social development needs, the planning of the Study Site also takes into account various factors including public aspirations for quality living environment, natural

environment and urban design, etc. One key consideration is to protect the ridgeline while preserve the existing natural and rehabilitated landscape as well as the man-made lake.

Upon multiple iterations of the preferred scale and density of the desired land uses, it has been found that a planned population of 5,000 would serve as a preferred population level for the Study Site. The planned population has taken into account the capacity constraints of ancillary infrastructure, surrounding context, internal spatial quality and public aspirations holistically, allowing room for creating a quality living environment while providing suitable tourism and recreational elements as well. A population of 5,000 has been adopted as a target for the formulation of the draft RODP which is in line with the public aspirations for appropriate development intensity at the Study Site. In terms of urban design, plot ratios in a range of 1.5 to 2.7 is proposed and considered compatible with the overall development of the Study Site and the surroundings. It is estimated that approximately 1,900 residential units will be provided.

3.5 Land Use and Facilities

3.5.1 Housing

Some members of the public, Lamma (South) and (North) Rural Committees supported a mix of private and subsidised housings. However, some members of the public and LDAC considered that the Study Site was not suitable for public housing and mass housing due to its isolated location, availability of proximate employment opportunities, and infrastructure and transport constraints etc. Members of Islands District Council suggested PRH was not suitable since it would not be cost-effective, and the transportation cost of future residents would be high. Some members of the public, local residents in Sok Kwu Wan and Lamma (South) Rural Committee expressed that local fishermen and villagers should be given priority in subsidised housing allocation.

Response

In response to the community's aspirations, different types of housing, including private and subsidised housing are proposed at the Study Site. Given its geographical location, HOS is provided in the Study Site which is considered suitable. Taking into account the public aspirations for affordable housing and preservation of the unique rural living style on Lamma Island, the ratio of 63% for private housing and 37% for subsidised housing for the Study Site is considered appropriate to achieve a balanced housing mix without compromising the island setting. In particular, around 1,200 private housing flats and around 700 HOS flats would be provided within the Study Site.

3.5.2 Marina

A majority of the members of the public, Lamma (South) and Lamma (North) Rural Committees opposed to the proposed marina development. They considered that Sok Kwu Wan Bay was not suitable for marina because it would adversely affect the water quality and existing fish culture there which is

incompatible with the rural and village settings of Lamma Island. There were also concerns about marine safety, environmental and ecological issues, and interface issues with other activities in the area etc. Despite the majority of objections, there were a few comments in support of marina facilities. They believed that there is great demand for berthing facilities and marina facilities would also increase job opportunities and economic benefits for the locals.

Response

In light of majority of the public comments received on the proposed marina development during the Stage 1 CE, the Study Team has taken into account various factors such as its potential impacts on water quality, incompatibility with the village setting and marine safety, etc. during the formulation of the draft RODP. Upon further review, it is considered that the marina facilities would not be put forward in the draft RODP.

3.5.3 Man-made Lake

A majority of the members of the public, NGOs and Islands District Council suggested that the man-made lake should be retained for recreational and amenity purposes. Some members noted that the man-made lake is suitable for boating, swimming and wind surfing activities, and stressed that the lake should not be privatised and should be accessible to all. Some members of LDAC suggested that the man-made lake can be taken up by the adjacent proposed hotel.

However, there were suggestions from some members of the public for partial preservation of the man-made lake. These members of the public and the Lamma (South) Rural Committee commented that the man-made lake was of low ecological value and suggested that a part of the lake could be reclaimed for amenity or housing purposes. There was also a suggestion from TPB that a man-made beach at the man-made lake could be considered. Some members from tourism and hotel industry noted that the man-made lake would not be important to the proposed hotel development whose future investor or operators might have reservations to take up the future management of the lake for the cost and liability issues.

Response

Taking into account the public views from the Stage 1 CE, the Study proposes full preservation of the unique man-made lake at the Study Site. The lake of about 5 hectares would be possible for a wide range of educational, leisure and recreational activities and lakeside open space for public enjoyment. The man-made lake is surrounded by public open space and a Water Sports Centre to ensure the lake is publicly accessible. These facilities all together will create a synergy effect by creating a hub of sports, recreational and tourism uses for the local community and public enjoyment.

3.5.4 Hotel and Tourism

While some members of the public, TPB and tourism and hotel industry agreed with the potential of hotel development in Hong Kong, facilities should be provided to support tourism development at the Study Site. Diverse views were received regarding the positioning of proposed hotel development. Some members of the public suggested that the hotel development should be small-scale and affordable to all, such as the existing holiday camp of YMCA of Hong Kong should also be continued for the provision of community facilities. On the contrary, the tourism and hotel industry suggested that the proposed hotel should be high-end and developed with unique themes that are related to the local context. They were of the view that high-end hotels would be more commercially viable in supporting sustainable tourism, providing local job opportunities and conserving local culture. However, Lamma (South) Rural Committee opposed to the high-end hotel development which would likely to be self-contained with their own facilities without benefiting the local community.

Some members of the public, tourism and hotel industry and TPB worried that hotel development would have impacts on the local characters of Lamma Island. Regarding the proposed Initial Option 2, members of LDAC and tourism and hotel industry were concerned about the interface problem of residential and hotel developments and requested for proper mitigation measures to address this issue. The tourism and hotel industry reminded that supporting facilities should be provided to serve the proposed hotel. The sewage treatment plant adjacent to the proposed hotel could be used for eco-education demonstration. More tourist attractions and annual festivals could be provided at the Study Site to make it attractive.

Response

In the draft RODP, a hotel development is proposed to enhance the tourism potential of the Study Site and bring in more economic activities to the area, together with other tourism and recreational facilities such as the man-made lake and the commercial area which includes the Entrance Plaza to the lake etc. The hotel development will be located in the eastern platform of the Study Site and will be secluded and separated from other residential development by the man-made lake. Together with this resort-type hotel in lower density, hostel facilities may also be provided in the Outdoor Recreation Centre to cater for the needs of different users and adding vibrancy to the Study Site. Opportunities for landscape treatment and greening will be provided to blend in the hotel facilities into the surrounding environment.

During the formulation of the draft RODP, provision of a wide range of tourism activities have been duly incorporated. Tourism facilities including a hotel development, fully retaining the magnificent man-made lake, and other supporting facilities such as waterfront promenade are proposed to enhance the tourism potential of the Study Site and to bring in more economic activities to the area. Furthermore, there are retail and dining facilities at the vibrant commercial area and large public areas for festive events proposed in the draft RODP. By capitalising the potential tourist resources at the ELQ together with other existing

tourist attractions on the island, a synergy effect can be created in attracting visitors.

3.5.5 Water Sports Centre

Many members of the public supported the proposed recreational facilities especially the Water Sports Centre for the Study Site. They considered that the proposed Water Sports Centre would allow the general public to enjoy and attract a lot of visitors by making use of the man-made lake for training and leisure water sports. Some members of the public and LDAC suggested that a kiosk and a spectator stand should be provided at the proposed Water Sports Centre. However, some members of the public, LDAC, and a professional institute worried about future management and cost of recreational facilities. There were also concerned about the water quality of the man-made lake for recreational uses.

Response

The Water Sports Centre will work in synergy with the adjacent man-made lake for the provision of non-motorised watersports and recreational facilities at the Study Site for wider public enjoyment. The technical feasibility, agents and actions needed for the implementation of the proposed Water Sports Centre would be investigated and evaluated at the next stage of the Study.

3.5.6 Other Land Uses and Facilities

Commercial Area

Some members of the public were expecting the development of shopping streets in the form of retail facilities in the proposed development to increase the vitality of the street. They also suggested establishing seafood markets by the sea for travelers to enjoy gourmet foods. They hoped that the commercial areas could serve basic needs through the provision of a pharmacy and a supermarket.

Response

Sufficient commercial spaces through the provision of the Lamma Hub including the bazaar-style commercial area surrounding the Entrance Plaza have been proposed. The Lamma Hub of the draft RODP is envisioned to be developed in the form of low-rise and low density commercial area with active frontages of restaurants and retail shops. The commercial area would add vibrancy to the Study Site and provide job opportunities for the local community. The provision of a pharmacy and a supermarket would be subject to the market conditions and future demand generated from the Study Site.

Tourist Information Centre

Some members of the public and TPB suggested that a museum showing history, culture and characters of Lamma Island should be considered. In particular, some NGOs suggested capitalising on the unique geological feature and history of Lamma Island for the development of a quarry museum as an attraction. There

was also a suggestion from some members of the public that recreational and educational facilities such as nature reserve or eco-park should be considered to promote eco-education and create job opportunities.

Response

To support the long term tourism development of Lamma Island, a Tourist Information Centre, which forms part of the “Institution and Community” (“IC”) site, is proposed to provide one-stop shop services to visitors including tourist enquiry counter, guided local tour information and a souvenir shop. There will also be a venue reserved for local cultural exhibition or public talks to promote the natural resources, history and fishing culture of Lamma Island. The provision of the Tourist Information Centre is subject to the future management and operation agent which will be explored in the next stage of Study.

Recreational Facilities

Some members of the public proposed that other recreational facilities such as rock-climbing and archery should be provided for the local community and to support tourism development. Some mentioned the lack of a public swimming pool on Lamma and requested the provision of children’s playgrounds, parks, sports and public facilities at the Study Site.

Some members of the public and local NGOs proposed the development of Leisure and Cultural Services Department-run holiday camps, and also suggested that the existing holiday camps operated by the YMCA of Hong Kong at the Study Site should be retained and integrated in the future development. Specifically, the YMCA of Hong Kong suggested that they could operate tourism and recreational programmes within the Study Site. They proposed the operation and management roles of an eco-friendly hotel, as well as the provision of a diversity of sports, education and community programmes at the Study Site.

Response

Having taking into consideration the public views received in Stage 1 CE, more recreational activities will be introduced in the draft RODP. A site of about 2 hectares at the northern platform will be designated for Outdoor Recreation Centre. A 0.2 hectares site located at the north-eastern side of the man-made lake is also reserved for Water Sports Centre use. The 5 hectares man-made lake will be fully preserved for recreation and amenity purposes. Bicycle path will be provided along the central access road, waterfront promenade and the lakeside open space for public enjoyment. The management and operation agents of these recreational facilities will be further identified in the next stage of Study.

Community Facilities

Some members of the public, local concern groups and LDAC suggested that more G/IC facilities, such as schools, clinics, a police post, should be provided at the Study Site to serve the local community. Many members of the public stressed that in order to serve the increase population, sufficient community

facilities like kindergarten, library, playground, fire station should be provided. In particular, many members of the public, as well as Islands District Council, LDAC and Lamma (South) Rural Committee, suggested that medical service should be provided to improve the medical and emergency services on Lamma Island. However, some members of the public were also skeptical on the feasibility of providing these community facilities as there might not be sufficient population to trigger such provisions under the current government standards.

Response

We understand the local community's aspirations for more community facilities in Sok Kwu Wan. A site has been reserved at the central part of the Study site for the provision a library, social welfare facilities and a police post. Meanwhile, an "IC" site has also been reserved at the eastern side of the Lamma Hub for a Community Health Centre cum Tourist Information Centre, which aimed to provide facilities such as clinical, local supporting services to the local community. The provision of the Community Health Centre cum Tourist Information Centre is subject to the future management and operation agent which will be explored in the next stage of Study.

Environmentally-Friendly Infrastructure

Some members of the public proposed that environmentally-friendly infrastructure, such as recycling facilities, solar powered street light and other renewable energy infrastructure, grey water recycling facilities encompassing the man-made lake, and vertical farms maintained by the community should be provided at the Study Site to promote an eco-friendly living style.

Response

With the goal to create an alternative living environment and to retain the existing car-free environment on the island, it is recommended that cycling and walking be prioritised as the major modes of transport at the Study Site. Majority of the population would be within the walking distance of the proposed ferry pier proposed at the central location of the Study Site. In addition, storage area for recyclables has been reserved in the design of the proposed refuse transfer facilities.

3.6 Accessibility

Many members of the public, the TPB and LDAC stressed the importance of connectivity and integration between the Study Site and existing development in Sok Kwu Wan. Some members of the public supported the proposed ferry service between the Study Site and existing pier in Sok Kwu Wan and suggested that ferry services should be provided between the Study Site to other areas of Hong Kong Island. Sufficient ferry services should also be provided to cater for the traffic demand of future residents. Many members of the public and TPB were concerned about the fare and frequency of the future ferry service whether it will be affordable by future residents and sustainable with the planned population. In

general, there were no objections on the proposed location of the new pier at the Study Site.

A majority of the comments received agreed that a land connection to Lo So Shing and Sok Kwu Wan along the coast is needed. There were also supports for better connection of hiking paths to the other parts of the island. While some members of the public accepted that minor reclamation could be tolerated for the ease of convenient access to the Study Site, some others and an NGO worried that the environment and natural shoreline would be affected by the proposed connection. Some members of Lamma (South) Rural Committee suggested that the proposed connection should allow the use of emergency vehicles to serve other parts of Sok Kwu Wan. However, some members of the public were also concerned about the proposed access road which is viewed as going against the planning intention of Lamma Island.

Many members of the public, a professional institute and an NGO had concerns on the traffic impact due to proposed increase in population at the Study Site. Members of Southern District Council suggested that the traffic impact to Aberdeen and Ap Lei Chau should be carefully considered and suitable marine facilities and transport infrastructure would be required to minimise traffic impacts. Furthermore, some members of the public and Island and Southern District Councils suggested that the linkage between Lamma Island and Southern District should be strengthened. Many members of the public and LDAC stressed that the transportation link between the Study Site and the future MTR on Hong Kong Island would be important to serve future residents and visitors to the Study Site.

Response

As for external connectivity, due to the proposed increase in population, it is proposed that existing ferry services between Sok Kwu Wan and Central will be extended to the Study Site and it is anticipated that frequency of ferry services will be enhanced to handle the traffic demand during the peak periods. Fares of future extension of ferry services however are subject to market conditions and future ferry operators. Currently, there are existing Kai To services between Sok Kwu Wan and Aberdeen, and it is also proposed that the services would be extended to the Study Site, where passengers will be picked up and dropped off from the public landing steps. Based on the traffic impact assessments conducted, the extension of existing Kai To services would be sufficient for the planned population of 5,000 and new ferry services as well as associated infrastructure at Aberdeen would not be necessary. The additional patronage generated from the Study Site to Aberdeen would only induce minimal traffic impact to Aberdeen areas.

The proposed transportation link between the Study Site and future MTR extension to Ap Lei Chau has also been considered. It is anticipated that the future population will mainly access to the urban areas via Central which enjoys more convenient connection to other areas. After preliminary review, there is no appropriate ferry pier identified at Ap Lei Chau for the connection to the Study Site, and thus there is no proposal to enhance the transport link between the Study Site and future MTR at this stage.

In terms of internal connectivity, comprehensive pedestrian and cycle track networks including public bicycle parking areas are proposed to promote walking and cycling as major transport modes within the Study Site. Upon further examination of the coastal connection to Sok Kwu Wan via Lo So Shing, it has been found that it may involve a fair amount of site formation works, disturbance to existing trees and shoreline, or potential land resumption and implementation issues for the section of the footpath through the “Comprehensive Development Area” site. As such, the proposed connection may need further investigation.

In addition, a central access corridor is proposed under the draft RODP. The proposed central access corridor is intended for the use of environmentally friendly transport modes, servicing vehicles for refuse collection or electricity substation, as well as emergency vehicles such as fire engine, with possession of permit issued by Transport Department.

3.7 Environmental and Ecological Impacts

3.7.1 Environmental Impacts

Some members of the public noted that the natural environment on Lamma should be conserved. Some members of the public and Southern District Council were concerned about the potential environmental impacts with regards to increase in population in Sok Kwu Wan. Many members of the public, local concern groups and Lamma (North) Rural Committee reminded that the future development should be supported by research on environmental impacts. Concerns were also raised on the existing illegal dumping of wastes on Lamma Island. There were some queries on how EIA has been performed. Some members of the public also criticised that the EIA has not been undertaken prior to engaging the public with the Initial Options.

Response

Preliminary environmental assessments and various technical assessments have been carried out to ascertain the preliminary feasibility of the Initial Options presented to the public. 12-month ecological surveys have been conducted and analysed. Potential environment issues including air quality, water quality, ecology and fisheries, noise, waste, land contamination, cultural heritage, landscape and visual, etc. have been studied. Findings from the said assessments have then been duly incorporated during the formulation of draft RODP. Upon the finalisation of the RODP after the Stage 2 CE, findings from the assessments will be included in the EIA, in which environmental impacts will be assessed in details and mitigation measures will be proposed if necessary.

With regard to the concern on the existing illegal dumping of wastes, the HKSAR Government has promulgated relevant regulations in controlling the illegal dumping activities in Hong Kong. Any illegal dumping of wastes would be prohibited and would be governed by the relevant ordinances.

3.7.2 Ecological Impacts

Many members of the public, an NGO and local concern groups stressed that the natural shorelines at Study Site and Coastal Protection Area in the surroundings should not be disturbed in order to protect the natural shoreline and marine ecology. With regard to the ecological value of the Study Site, the local concern groups did not agree with the Study findings of low ecological value at the Study Site and suggested that mitigations measures would be required. Some members of the public and TPB pointed out that the existing woodland mainly consisted of trees of single species. It was suggested that biodiversity could be enhanced at the Study Site. However, some members of the Lamma (South) Rural Committee opined that as those existing trees were planted in quarry rehabilitation and were not of high ecological value, there was no need to retain them.

Many members of the public and local concern groups were concerned on the ecological impacts from the future development at the Study Site such as construction impacts and its effects on the surrounding ecologically sensitive areas. Some members of the public suggested that the overall ecology of Lamma Island should be studied to assess the overall ecologic impact of the future development. A member of the public commented that there is a potential for the proposed development to breach the UN Convention on Biodiversity due to the presence of protected creatures.

Response

In accordance with the requirements of the EIA Study Brief under the EIAO, the Study is subject to the relevant EIA to be conducted to make sure that the proposed development is environmentally acceptable in terms of air quality, water quality, ecology and fisheries, noise, waste, land contamination, cultural heritage, landscape and visual, etc. The concerns regarding ecology raised during the Stage 1 CE have been closely examined and considered during the formulation of the draft RODP.

In response to the EIA, the Study Team will examine the ecology of the Study Site as required. Mitigation measures on potential ecological impacts during the construction and operation phases will be investigated and proposed within the detailed EIA Study. The impacts of the planned population on the surrounding areas will also be examined in the detailed technical assessments. Suggestions on the enhancement of the biodiversity of the Study Site have been considered. Though these trees are not of high ecological value, the trees collectively remain to be a valuable landscape resource. The felling of trees will be limited to whatever means necessary and there will also be tree replanting. Also, the proposed development will not encroach into the Coastal Protection Area in the surrounding area. The natural shoreline will be preserved as far as possible in the draft RODP. Consideration will be given to add ecological enhancement measures in the man-made lake and tree planting within the Study Site. This will be subject to further liaison with implementation agents.

3.8 Others

3.8.1 Infrastructure

Some members of the public noted that the lack of infrastructure renders the Study Site as inappropriate for meeting the immediate housing needs of the society as a whole. It was believed by some members of the public that the development of necessary infrastructure would further contribute to the degradation of the Study Site, which contravenes with the planning intention of the island. There were some queries on the total cost of infrastructure for the proposed development.

Response

With around 20 hectare of platform area which is mostly government land, the Study Site has the potential to help with the provision towards the imminent housing demand of Hong Kong. The technical feasibility on the provision of necessary infrastructure in support of the proposed development have been carried out to ensure the adequate provision of relevant infrastructure to cater for various development under the Study. As it is at its initial stage of study, the cost of infrastructure for the proposed development will be assessed after the finalisation of RODP.

3.8.2 Implementation

Some members of the public, Islands District Council and Lamma (South) and (North) Rural Committees considered that the Study Site has been vacant for years and was not a natural feature, and therefore future development should be expedited to meet the need of Hong Kong. Members of the Town Planning Board and LDAC, and some members of the public commented that timeframe and phasing should be provided for the future development. They also requested for more detailed information on implementation of the proposed development, including the logistics of construction and implementation agents.

Response

Implementation of site formation and infrastructure works will be carried out by the Government. The Study Site will then be tendered out to private sectors and Housing Authority to construct private and subsidised housing development respectively. Land required for other uses such as recreational and community facilities may be allocated to relevant departments or leased to NGO for implementation. Detailed information on the implementation of the proposed development including construction and implementation agents will be provided in the next stage of Study.

3.8.3 Structure of the Study Process

Many professional institutes considered that the Study should look into strategic planning context and commented that the present Study approach has substantially constrained the planning scope and possible inception of new ideas. They

suggested that the Study Team should identify the needs of the community and Hong Kong as a whole, before evaluating the constraints and potentials of the Study Site and sustainability of future land uses. Many members of the public, green groups and Lamma (South) and Lamma (North) Rural Committees suggested that there should be a strategic plan for the whole Lamma Island.

A professional institute enquired why the Study which should include strategic, environmental and economic inputs is being directed by CEDD within a compressed programme. They suggested that all the comments should be properly addressed before proceeding to the next stage of work. They further suggested that the Study Brief should be circulated to appropriate professional institutes for comments. Some members of the public believed that the Stage 1 CE should have been used to formulate planning and design concepts instead of promoting pre-conceived Initial Options. A professional institute also remarked that the study phasing should include a feedback loop after the Stage 1 CE before proceeding directly to the finalisation of the draft RODP.

Response

As specified in the Explanatory Statement attached to the prevailing Approved Lamma Island OZP No. S/I-LI/9, public views should be sought on any future major development here in view of the size and visually prominent location of the Study Site. The Government had launched the Study to work with stakeholders to formulate the optimal option for the use of the land resources at the Site. The Study Team had sufficiently examined the strategic planning context based on the local need for tourism facilities as well as the imminent demand for housing supply in Hong Kong. The vision and proposals were drawn based on the strategic directives as well as the public comments. The Study stresses the importance of community engagement which comprises of two stages, in addition to the early discussion with the stakeholders. Throughout the Study process, various aspects under this Study including the vision and guiding principles, baseline information, strategic and local planning contexts and formulation of Initial Options and provision of land uses have been re-examined and accounted for. The particular concerns on the strategic plan for all of Lamma are noted, and the constraints and potentials of the Study Site including the population threshold of infrastructure' carrying capacity were also drawn. The information had been posted on the Study webpage for public viewing.

3.8.4 Community Engagement

Many members of the public and local concern groups were dissatisfied with the timing of consultation period which straddled onto two major public holidays. They believed that the consultation was carried out in a rushed manner and that there was not enough time to provide comments. Some members of the public and local concern groups were discontented that the Government did not address their views expressed in the consultation activities. They held a sceptical view that the Study Team would be proceeding with the Study despite the fact that the consensus on the visions and basic principles were not yet established and local concerns were not yet fully addressed. They suggested that the Study Team should accept alternative land use proposals in the next stage. Some members of

the public commented that findings from different CE events should be shared with the public to facilitate exchange of ideas and information among stakeholders. More baseline information, findings of technical assessment as well as presentation and publicity materials should be uploaded to the Study website to facilitate information exchange.

Response

Prior to the formulation of the vision and guiding principles of the Study, pre-engagement activities were conducted to collect initial public views from March to April 2012. Various stakeholders including green groups, professional institutes, District Council and Rural Committees were consulted. With the feedback from the attendants and consulted stakeholders from these meetings, the vision and guiding principles were established. The two-month Stage 1 CE began in early December 2012 and ended in early February 2013.

In addition to the Study webpage for public viewing of the information of the Study, roving exhibitions and posters etc., community workshop and forums were organised to facilitate open discussion, a focus group meeting with green groups, professional institutes and concerned parties was also organised to address concerns and exchange views. Upon the participants' request, the summary of technical assessments and engagement materials/ presentations were also uploaded onto the Study webpage.

More than 520 written comments were received during the Stage 1 CE. Comments and concerns received from the public have been duly considered, along with the feedback from advisory and statutory bodies. The Study Team has taken into consideration all the comments and concerns received during the Stage 1 CE into consideration when formulating the draft RODP. Proposals and comments have been examined in light of the planning and engineering constraints and opportunities, and detailed feasibility and technical assessments have been conducted.

4 Way Forward

The comments and suggestions collected during the Stage 1 CE have already been compiled, analysed and considered. The public comments and suggestions have been taken into account in producing the draft RODP for the ELQ area.

Having taken into account the public comments, proposals received, as well as the relevant environmental and technical assessments, we will formulate a draft RODP and Layout Plans. The draft RODP will be put forward to the community for discussion during the Stage 2 CE.

Appendix 1:

List of Stage 1 Community Engagement Activities

Roving Exhibitions (In Chronological Order)		
Dates (D/M/Y)	Locations	
07/12/2012 – 16/12/2012	Sok Kwu Wan Ferry Pier	
17/12/2012 – 26/12/2012	Yung Shue Wan Ferry Pier	
27/12/2012 – 06/01/2013	Aberdeen Promenade	
07/01/2013 – 20/01/2013	Central Pier No.4	
21/01/2013 – 31/01/2013	2/F Lobby, Harbour Building in Central	
Briefings to Public/ Advisory Bodies (In Chronological Order)		
Dates (D/M/Y)	Organisations/Occasions	Appendices
14/12/2012	Town Planning Board	Appendix 2
17/12/2012	Islands District Council	Appendix 3
27/12/2012	Lamma (South) Rural Committee	Appendix 4
22/01/2013	Legislative Council Panel on Development	Appendix 5
30/01/2013	Land and Development Advisory Committee (Planning Sub-committee)	Appendix 6
04/02/2013	Southern District Council	Appendix 7
20/02/2013	Lamma (North) Rural Committee	Appendix 8
Focus Group Meetings (In Chronological Order)		
06/02/2013	Focus Group Meeting with Green Groups and Professional Institutes	Appendix 9
04/03/2013	Focus Group Meeting with Tourism and Hotel Industry	Appendix 10
Workshop and Forums (In Chronological Order)		
05/01/2013	Community Workshop (held at the open area outside Tin Hau Temple, Sok Kwu Wan, Lamma Island)	Appendix 11
12/01/2013	Community Forum (held at Northern Lamma School, 1 Yung Shue Ling, Yung Shue Wan, Lamma Island)	Appendix 12
19/01/2013	Public Forum (held at Multi-purpose Hall, 3/F, City Gallery, 3 Edinburgh Place, Central)	Appendix 13

Appendix 2:

Minutes of the Town Planning Board Meeting (Extracted)

**Minutes of 1025th Meeting of the
Town Planning Board held on 14.12.2012**

Present

Permanent Secretary for Development
(Planning and Lands)

Mr. Thomas Chow

Chairman

Mr. Stanley Y.F. Wong

Vice-Chairman

Professor S.C. Wong

Mr. Timothy K.W. Ma

Professor Edwin H.W. Chan

Ms. Bonnie J.Y. Chan

Professor K.C. Chau

Mr. Rock C.N. Chen

Mr. H.W. Cheung

Dr. Wilton W.T. Fok

Mr. Ivan C.S. Fu

Mr. Sunny L.K. Ho

Mr. Lincoln L.H. Huang

Professor Eddie C.M. Hui

Ms. Janice W.M. Lai

Mr. Dominic K.K. Lam

Dr. C.P. Lau

Mr. Patrick H.T. Lau

Ms. Julia M.K. Lau

Mr. Maurice W. M. Lee

Mr. H.F. Leung

Mr. Clarence W.C. Leung

Mr. Laurence L.J. Li

Mr. Roger K.H. Luk

Miss Anita W.T. Ma

Mr. Stephen H.B. Yau

Dr. W.K. Yau

Principal Assistant Secretary (Transport)
Transport and Housing Bureau
Miss Winnie Wong

Deputy Director of Environmental Protection
Mr. C.W. Tse

Deputy Director of Lands (General)
Mr. Jeff Lam (a.m.)
Director of Lands
Ms. Bernadette Linn (p.m.)

Director of Planning
Mr. K.K. Ling

Deputy Director of Planning/District
Miss Ophelia Y.S. Wong

Secretary

Absent with Apologies

Professor P.P. Ho

Ms. Christina M. Lee

Dr. W.K. Lo

Assistant Director (2), Home Affairs Department
Mr. Eric Hui

In Attendance

Assistant Director of Planning/Board
Ms. Christine K.C. Tse

Chief Town Planner/Town Planning Board
Ms. Donna Y.P. Tam (a.m.)
Mr. Edward W.M. Lo (p.m.)

Senior Town Planner/Town Planning Board
Ms. Donna Y.P. Tam (a.m.)
Ms. Caroline T.Y. Tang (p.m.)

General

Agenda Item 3

[Open Meeting]

Planning and Engineering Study on Future Land Use at
the Ex-Lamma Quarry Area at Sok Kwu Wan, Lamma
Island - Feasibility Study (Stage 1 Community Engagement)
(TPB Paper No. 9242)

[The meeting was conducted in Cantonese.]

3. The following representatives of the Planning Department (PlanD), Civil Engineering and Development Department (CEDD) and Study Consultants were invited to the meeting at this point:

Ms. Elsa Cheuk	Chief Town Planner/Special Duties (CTP/SD), PlanD
Mr. David Lo Kwok Chung	Chief Engineer/Islands (CE/Is), CEDD
Ms. Betty Ho	Community Engagement Team Leader, PlanArch
Mr. Leung Kam Shing	Urban Designer, Arup
Mr. Lee Wai Lam	Urban Planner, Arup
Mr. Barton Leung	Assistant Town Planner, Arup
Ms. Lau Sze Hong	Assistant Town Planner, Arup

4. The Chairman extended a welcome and invited CTP/SD to brief Members on the Paper.

5. Ms. Elsa Cheuk, CTP/SD, briefed Members on the background of the Planning and Engineering Study on Future Land Use at Ex-Lamma Quarry Area at Sok Kwu Wan, Lamma Island – Feasibility Study (Stage 1 Community Engagement) and made the following main points:

- (a) in January 2012, the PlanD and CEDD commissioned the Study;
- (b) the overall objective of the Study was to examine the future land use and explore the development potential of the Ex-Lamma Quarry site (the Study Site) including residential development and other compatible uses;
- (c) the ex-Lamma Quarry site (the Study Site) was zoned “Undetermined” (“U”) (34.3 ha) on the approved Lamma Island Outline Zoning Plan (OZP) No. S/I-LI/9 on the northern coast of Sok Kwu Wan, Lamma Island;
- (d) the Study would include technical assessments to confirm the feasibility of the preferred land use options at the subsequent stage. The findings and recommendations would serve as a reference for the revision of the relevant town plans to guide the future developments at the Study Site.

6. With the aid of a Powerpoint presentation, Mr. Leung Kam Shing, Study Consultant, briefed Members on the Study as detailed in the Paper:

The Study Area

- (a) the Study Area (59.9 ha) covered the “U” zone (34.3 ha) (the Study Site) (including 20ha platform area), the adjacent “Comprehensive Development Area” (“CDA”) zone (the former cement plant), natural slopes and shorelines;
- (b) the Study Area consisted of the following unique features: the rehabilitated slopes which became a “green backdrop”; the man-made lake; the steep natural terrain; the long seawall, shoreline and lakefront; and the proximity of the area to the fish culture zone and Sok Kwu Wan seafood street;

The Vision and Planning Considerations

- (c) the overall vision of the Study was to create a green and sustainable waterfront neighbourhood that met the land use needs while complementing the local character, with guiding principles covering the development needs, local aspirations, environment and infrastructure;

- (d) the Study Site was subject to the following key planning considerations:
 - the existing characters of Lamma Island and the rich landscape resources should be respected;
 - major disturbance to the habitat should be mitigated as far as possible;
 - the connection to the Study Site should be improved;
 - basic infrastructure and utility facilities should be provided;
 - disturbance to the existing fish culture zones should be minimized;
 - the 20ha platform area presented good potential for housing, tourism, recreation, and other compatible uses to meet the land use needs; and
 - there was potential to develop the Study Site as a tourist destination and for weekend getaway, and as a resort development;

[Miss Anita W.T. Ma arrived to join the meeting at this point.]

Initial Public Views

- (e) views collected during the informal discussions with local parties, green groups, professional institutions and other concern groups in March/April 2012 were as follows:
 - the natural landscape, the rural character and the ‘car-free’ environment of Lamma Island should be conserved;
 - the 5 ha man-made lake should be preserved for public enjoyment;
 - extensive housing was not supported though provision of public housing could be explored;
 - provision of public and private housing developments should be considered; and
 - the proposal should consider integrating the Study Site with the adjacent ‘CDA’ zone;

Initial Land Use Options

- (f) two initial land use options, which included “Seaside Living” (i.e. housing) and “Seaside Paradise” (i.e. tourism plus housing), were formulated. With a flat size ranging from 50m² to 100m², the respective population of the two options was estimated to be about 5,000 to 7,000 (Option 1) and 2,800 (Option 2);
- (g) under Options 1a and 1b (“Seaside Living” – a Green Community), housing developments were the major land uses. Design features included an Entrance Plaza, an Eco-tourism Centre and a Community Square. Two variation options (Options 1a and 1b) were proposed;
- (h) only minor upgrading works for the existing fresh water system was required for Option 1a. However, a new submarine fresh water pipe connected to Hong Kong Island and other associated infrastructure facilities were required to support the planned population under Option 1b;

[Mr. H.W. Cheung arrived to join the meeting at this point.]

- (i) Option 2 (“Seaside Paradise” – a Tourist Paradise for All) aimed to enhance the tourism appeal for the Study Site as featured by a number of tourism and recreational facilities, including Lakeside and Hillside Resorts providing 250 rooms; a low-rise, pavilion-style cluster labelled as “Lamma Hub” (low-rise commercial uses serving as the major arrival point) and a Water Sports Centre. Housing developments would also be provided;
- (j) a comparison of the initial options was as follows:

	Option 1a ‘Seaside Living’	Option 1b ‘Seaside Living’	Option 2 ‘Seaside Paradise’
Population			
Estimated Population	5,000	7,000	2,800

	Option 1a ‘Seaside Living’	Option 1b ‘Seaside Living’	Option 2 ‘Seaside Paradise’
Housing			
No. of Flats	2,000	2800	1,000
Plot Ratio	0.6 - 1.8	0.75 - 2.0	0.6 - 1.5
Building Height			
Building Height	Max 10 storeys	Max 12 storeys	Max 8 storeys
Major Land Uses			
Housing	Low to medium density housing		Low to medium density housing
Communal Spaces	Woodland Park		Woodland Park
	Lakeside Park		Lakeside Park
	Entrance Plaza, Community Square		Lamma Hub
Leisure and Recreational Facilities	Marina Facilities		Marina Facilities
	Eco-tourism Centre		Resort Hotel Lakeside: 220 rooms Hillside: 30 rooms
	Entrance Plaza		Water Sports Centre

Accessibility and Connectivity

- (k) similar connectivity strategies were adopted in both options to enhance the connectivity of the Study Site:
- a new pier was proposed at the mid-point of the Study Site with ferry services to Central/Aberdeen;
 - new hiking trails were proposed to link up with other parts of Lamma Island;
 - cycle tracks and pedestrian walkways would be planned throughout the Study Site; and
 - a tree-lined access corridor was proposed to connect different sites within the Study Site;

Stage 1 Community Engagement

(l) a two-stage community engagement programme was proposed; and

(m) Stage 1 Community Engagement to solicit public views on the initial land use options at the Study Site commenced on 7.12.2012 and would last till early February 2013. Community workshop, community forum, public forum and roving exhibition would be organized. The Islands and Southern District Councils, Lamma Island (North) & (South) Rural Committees, the Town Planning Board and the Legislative Council would be consulted.

7. The Chairman asked Members to comment on the Study.

8. The Vice-chairman noted that the existing population on Lamma Island was about 5,900 and about 400 people were living in Sok Kwu Wan. He asked if the proposed residential developments in the Study Site were targeted for the existing population on Lamma Island or for outsiders, and how the traffic needs of the proposed development would be met.

9. In response, Mr. Lee Wai Lam, Study Consultant, made the following main points:

(a) during the initial informal discussions, some local residents in Sok Kwu Wan expressed their wishes to reserve some flats within the Study Site for Lamma residents as land available for housing developments on the Island was limited;

(b) on the other hand, there was a pressing demand for housing supply in Hong Kong. As Lamma Island was located close to the urban area and there was 20ha of formed land within the Study Site, there was scope for residential developments to address the territorial housing demand; and

- (c) it was therefore proposed that in the long-term, the Study Area could provide housing land to address both the local and territorial demand.

10. Mr. Leung Kam Shing supplemented that in the Traffic Impact Assessment (TIA) undertaken during the initial phase of the Study, an additional ferry pier was proposed in the Study Site to serve future needs.

11. A Member had the following questions/comments:

- (a) noting that there were proposals for recreational, tourism and residential uses, what was the priority for the different land uses within the Study Site?
- (b) the proposed population of the Study Site would be more than the total existing population of Lamma Island, which was only 5,900 people. The local people might have some concerns on the influx of outsiders to the Island;
- (c) the development options shown in the Stage 1 Community Engagement Digest and presented at the meeting were similar to the existing development in Discovery Bay. There seemed to be no relationship between the proposed future developments and the existing character of Lamma Island; and
- (d) there were already some holiday camps on Lamma Island. It was doubtful if there was a need to provide two resort hotels in the area. The resort hotel developments might also have impacts on the local character of Lamma Island.

12. In response, Mr. Lee Wai Lam and Mr. Leung Kam Shing made the following main points:

- (a) the two proposed land use options were put forward to solicit public views on the preferred land uses in the area. While it was considered that the Study Site provided scope for housing developments to address the housing demand, it would be ensured that the future developments would be compatible with the existing local characters and ambience of Lamma Island;
- (b) previous study had confirmed that it was feasible to develop spa and resort uses in Hong Kong and Lamma Island was considered as one of the suitable places for the provision of such uses given its good scenery and convenient location; and
- (c) future developments would be in the form of a number of small development clusters each with their own community centre, instead of a single large-scale development implemented by one single developer similar to that of the Discovery Bay development.

[Miss Julia M.K. Lau arrived to join the meeting at this point.]

13. Some Members have the following questions and comments on the Study and the development options:

- (a) there was no mention on the timeline of the future developments in the area. There was also no description on the existing characters of Lamma Island and how the characters were to be preserved with the development of the Study Site and how the proposed small developments concept could be implemented. The Study team was suggested to consider how the existing character of Lamma Island would be transformed and mixed well with the new developments;
- (b) 3-D model should be prepared to illustrate the proposed development intensities;

- (c) the existing residential developments on Lamma Island were concentrating on the western parts of the Island, which were protected from the strong wind from the east. The suitability of proposed residential developments on the eastern part of the Island should be subject to further study;
- (d) the Study Site was considered suitable for recreation and leisure uses because of its scenic views and unique characters. The proposed building height of 12 storeys was considered excessive in this area;
- (e) there was a lack of attractive tourist spots in Hong Kong. The Study Site, being located in a scenic area, had potential to be developed for tourism and recreational uses. Consideration should be given to provide more tourism facilities such as eco-lodge and hotel. Since there was no natural beach in the area, consideration might be given to provide a man-made beach at the existing man-made lake. Facilities showing the history, culture and character of Lamma Island should also be provided;
- (f) the public engagement exercise should focus on the main objective of the future developments and to solicit views of the public on whether the area should primarily be used for housing or tourism development. Some of the key considerations, such as the planned population, traffic implication and provision of Government, institution or community facilities should be highlighted to facilitate discussion during the public engagement process;
- (g) the Study team should consider the fare and frequency of the future ferry service and whether the fare would be affordable by future residents. Whether the proposed ferry service was sustainable with the planned population in the area should also be considered. The proposed pier was located close to the existing pier at Sok Kwu Wan which might pose danger to marine traffic. The ferry traffic would also have adverse impact on the existing fish culture zone to the south-west of the area. Consideration should be given to move the new pier to the north-eastern part of the area;
- (h) the woodland of the quarry face at the backdrop of the Study Site consisted of only single species which had a short lifespan. The ecosystem could be

improved by introducing more varieties of trees and increasing the biodiversity during the development process; and

- (i) more information on the construction logistics and potential adverse impacts generated by the construction works should be provided.

[Mr. Clarence W.C. Leung arrived to join the meeting at this point.]

14. Ms. Elsa Cheuk made the following main responses to Members' questions and comments:

- (a) Lamma Island, with its good scenic views, possessed great potential to be developed as a tourist spot both for tourists and local people. On the other hand, the formed land within the Study Site provided a good opportunity for housing developments to address the pressing housing demand in the territory. The options proposed were derived based on the two major premises and they would be considered under the Study;
- (b) it was intended that all future developments in the area would be low to medium-rise which would be compatible with the existing character and environment of Lamma Island;
- (c) taking into account the transport costs involved and local aspiration for the provision of public housing in the area, it was considered that both public and private housings could be considered;
- (d) there was also scope to introduce some new elements such as a marina and water sports facilities such that the area could be developed as a tourist spot under Option 2. It was the intention that the proposed facilities would be for public use;
- (e) according to the TIA undertaken for the Study, the increase in traffic demand from the proposed developments could be accommodated by

increasing the frequency of the existing ferry service serving the area. The location of the proposed pier and its potential impact on the existing marine traffic and the fish culture zone would be studied in the technical assessments to confirm the feasibility of the preferred land use options at the subsequent stage of the Study; and

- (f) implementation mechanism of the proposed small developments concept would be considered in the detailed study stage.

15. A Member commented that whether the Study Site was suitable for housing developments should be considered having regard to the local character of Lamma Island. Another Member concurred and said that more information on how the proposed developments would connect with the existing developments and relate to the character of Lamma Island should be provided in the public consultation documents.

16. A Member was of the view that it was more important to provide more information on the main development objective of the area, while detailed design elements could be considered at the later stage of the Study.

17. The Chairman asked the Study team to take note of the comments made by Members in the formulation of the preferred option at the next stage of the Study.

18. As Members had no more question to raise, the Chairman thanked the representatives of PlanD and CEDD and the Study Consultants for attending the meeting. They all left the meeting at this point.

Appendix 3:

Minutes of Islands District Council Meeting (Extracted)

XI. Planning and Engineering Study on Future Land Use at the Ex-Lamma Quarry Area at Sok Kwu Wan, Lamma Island – Feasibility Study : Stage 1 Community Engagement

The Chairman said that he supported the development plan, and that residents of Lamma Island should be consulted on the options and details of arrangement. The Planning Department should discuss the options with the two Rural Committees on Lamma, and the consultant should maintain communication with environmentalists so that environmental protection and community construction could be achieved in a balanced manner.

A member said that the plan would be beneficial to the development of Lamma South, and both Option 1 and 2 would boost the population on the island. He hoped that the development would not be monopolized by syndicates and that the public could indeed enjoy the facilities.

A member did not support the construction of public housing in the project. He said that merits of both options should be incorporated into one option and that the artificial lake should be retained and plot ratio be increased. And if the plot ratio could be increased, he enquired whether it would be possible to include a resort hotel into the plan.

A member said that the demand for public housing of Lamma Island residents should be determined before the construction of public housing. He also said that the development should not be monopolized by syndicates. He said that characteristics of Lamma Island should be preserved and public spaces could indeed be enjoyed by members of the public.

A member said that the initial options were not circumspect and that the Government should gather opinions widely. A balance between development and preservation should be maintained. There would be a greater demand for medical services when the development materialized and the Government should provide for the services. She also hoped that the objection of environmentalists would not hamper the development plan.

The Vice-chairlady was supportive of the plan in principle. She said that the plan should be improved and re-formulated after consulting the local people. She gave the example of Tung Chung to illustrate the need of holistic planning.

The representative of the Planning Department was appreciative of the support of members. The Government would continue to discuss with the two Rural Committees and the local people and to gather their opinions. She gave the following responses to member's enquiries:

- (a) The theme of Option 1 was housing development and that of Option 2 was tourism. Both were based on the concept of people-oriented development. -The establishment of holiday facilities would attract local and overseas tourists.
- (b) Lamma Island was nearest to the city centre among the islands and was suitable for housing development. Various types of housing could be built and there had yet been a final decision.
- (c) Option 1b would require giving up half of the artificial lake but would be able to house a greater number of residents.
- (d) Community facilities and transport facilities would be determined by the population level.
- (e) The land was owned by the Government currently.

Appendix 4:

Gist of Comments from the meeting with Lamma (South) Rural Committee

**Planning and Engineering Study on Future Land Use at the Ex-Lamma Quarry
Area – Feasibility Study**

**Quick Gist on the Meeting with Lamma Island (South) Rural Committee on 27
December, 2012 at Lamma Island (South) Rural Committee Office**

Attendance:

Chow Yuk-tong, Chairman
Kwok Tam-fook, Vice-chairman
Chau Ying, Indigenous Inhabitant Representative
Chow Lai Sum, Resident Representative
Chan Yuet-wai, Indigenous Inhabitant Representative,
Chan Cho-ping, Resident Representative,
Chan Wai-ming, Indigenous Inhabitant Representative
Chan Ho-yin, Indigenous Inhabitant Representative
Wu Kwok-kwong, Resident Representative
Yiu Wan-kwai, Indigenous Inhabitant Representative
Yiu Man-fai, Resident Representative
Cheng Tai Shing, Fishermen Representative
Lai Mun-ming
Lau Wai Kee
Mr Tam
Mr Leung

Government Departments Representatives:

Mr Lo Kwok-chung, David	CEDD
Ms To Wai-tsz, Isabella	CEDD
Ms Cheuk Hau-kwan, Elsa	Planning Department
Mr Lui Yu-man, Timothy	Planning Department
Mr Clement Miu	Planning Department

Consultants Representatives:

Ms Theresa Yeung	Ove Arup & Partners
Mr Barton Leung	Ove Arup & Partners

Ms Lau Sze Hong	Ove Arup & Partners
Ms Betty S.F. Ho	PlanArch Consultants Ltd.
Mr Cheng Pui-kan	PlanArch Consultants Ltd.

Comments from participants and consultants on the future land use at the Ex-Lamma Quarry Area are as follows:

1. Comments on Land Use Proposals

- 1.1. The small knoll at the Woodland Park was planted with trees during the rehabilitation of ex-quarry site and there are no ecological values. Therefore instead of preservation, it should be developed.
- 1.2. Initial option 2 was preferred as larger population might not necessarily be good. Future development should benefit local residents.
- 1.3. The role of Lamma Island as the back garden of Hong Kong should be considered in the planning process.
- 1.4. Future development must benefit Sok Kwu Wan residents. Since there was a shortage of land for Small House development in Sok Kwu Wan, they proposed to develop one to two residential buildings with about a hundred units in the form of Home Ownership Scheme units. Priorities should be given to local residents to purchase these units.
- 1.5. They enquired about the building height of proposed residential development.
- 1.6. They enquired whether future development could provide improvement to sewerage facilities.
- 1.7. The man-made lake did not contribute much to the ecology, and therefore the shallow waters could be filled for beautification work or other uses. They also suggested to develop houses on top of the lake without affecting the water body.
- 1.8. They fully supported future development of the ex-quarry site.

2. Comments on Location of Proposed Pier

- 2.1. Some participants suggested constructing a pier on the north-eastern side of the Study Site to minimize impact to the inner harbour of Sok Kwu Wan and to shorten the ferry journey time.

- 2.2. Other participants considered that constructing a pier on the north-eastern side of the Study Site was undesirable and unnatural as it would affect marine ecology along the coast. Besides, the boarding and alighting would have to be taken place at locations with strong wind and large waves. Therefore, they considered that the proposed location by the consultant was more appropriate.

3. Comments on Proposed Marina Development

- 3.1. The proposed marina was not feasible because the proposed area was not big enough and it could only provide berthing facilities for around 20 yachts.
- 3.2. Should the marina be developed, it could only take place near the waterfront area to the northeast of the Study Site so that the yachts would not have to travel in waters of the inner harbour area of Sok Kwu Wan.
- 3.3. They enquired whether floating pontoon or mooring would be adopted for the proposed marina.
- 3.4. They enquired whether the proposed marina would be managed by the Government.
- 3.5. They objected to a designated marina as yachts berthing at the marina might lead to engine oil leaking and sewerage discharge, which would pollute the mariculture rafts in Sok Kwu Wan.
- 3.6. In the past, they were more than 100 yachts used to berthing at Sok Kwu Wan frequently for sightseeing purpose. They suggested that there was no need to designate a marina, but could provide a pier for boarding and alighting, while waiting could be made offshore outside harbour area of Sok Kwu Wan.

4. Comments on Transport Linkage

- 4.1. They supported developing road connection between the Study Site and Lo So Shing for convenient access. They also suggested that village vehicles should be allowed at the Study Site for goods delivery, home-moving and home renovation purposes. The road connection could also provide easy access for fire engines from the Study Site to

other parts of Sok Kwu Wan.

- 4.2. The proposed road should align along the coastal area between the Study Site and Lo So Shing. It could be in a form of road or boardwalk above the pebble beach in the coastal area.
- 4.3. They considered that the road connection between the Study Site and Lo So Shing would not affect the mature trees and it would have minimal impact to the environment.

5. Concerns on the Potential Impacts to Lamma Island

- 5.1. They worried that substantial population increase would affect the local rural lifestyle.

6. Comments on Overall Planning of Lamma Island

- 6.1. Since there were some undeveloped areas on Lamma Island, the Government should establish an overall planning strategy prior to the formulation of future land use of the Study Site.
- 6.2. Since the natural environment near the power station was disturbed, these areas could be developed in future.

Appendix 5: Minutes of Legislative Council Panel on Development (Extracted)

立法會
Legislative Council

LC Paper No. CB(1)735/12-13
(These minutes have been
seen by the Administration)

Ref : CB1/PL/DEV/1

Panel on Development

**Minutes of meeting
held on Tuesday, 22 January 2013, at 2:30 pm
in Conference Room 3 of the Legislative Council Complex**

Members present : Dr Hon LAU Wong-fat, GBM, GBS, JP
(Chairman) Hon Tony TSE Wai-chuen (Deputy
Chairman) Hon James TO Kun-sun
Hon CHAN Kam-lam, SBS, JP
Hon Abraham SHEK Lai-him, SBS, JP
Hon Frederick FUNG Kin-kee, SBS,
JP Hon Cyd HO Sau-lan
Hon CHAN Hak-kan, JP Hon
CHAN Kin-por, BBS, JP
Dr Hon Priscilla LEUNG Mei-fun,
JP Hon IP Kwok-him, GBS, JP
Hon Mrs Regina IP LAU Suk-yee, GBS,
JP Hon Alan LEONG Kah-kit, SC
Hon LEUNG Kwok-hung
Hon Albert CHAN Wai-
yip Hon Claudia MO
Hon Michael TIEN Puk-sun, BBS, JP
Hon James TIEN Pei-chun, GBS,
JP Hon WU Chi-wai, MH
Hon Gary FAN Kwok-wai
Hon CHAN Chi-chuen
Hon CHAN Han-pan
Dr Hon Kenneth CHAN Ka-lok
Hon CHAN Yuen-han, SBS, JP

Hon LEUNG Che-cheung, BBS, MH, JP
Hon Kenneth LEUNG
Hon Alice MAK Mei-kuen, JP
Dr Hon KWOK Ka-ki
Dr Hon Fernando CHEUNG Chiu-hung
Dr Hon CHIANG Lai-wan, JP
Ir Dr Hon LO Wai-kwok, BBS, MH, JP

Members attending : Hon WONG Kwok-hing, MH
Hon TANG Ka-piu

Member absent : Hon Emily LAU Wai-hing, JP

Public officers attending : **Agenda item IV**

Mr Paul CHAN Mo-po, MH, JP
Secretary for Development

Mr Thomas CHOW Tat-ming, JP
Permanent Secretary for Development
(Planning and Lands)

Mr WAI Chi-sing, JP
Permanent Secretary for Development (Works)

Mr Thomas CHAN Chung-ching, JP
Deputy Secretary for Development
(Planning and Lands)1

Mr Rex CHANG Wai-yuen, JP
Deputy Secretary for Development
(Planning and Lands)2

Ms Grace LUI Kit-yuk, JP
Deputy Secretary for Development (Works)1

Mr Raymond LEE Kai-wing
Head of Energizing Kowloon East Office
Development Bureau

Mr HON Chi-keung, JP
Director of Civil Engineering and Development

Agenda item V

Mr LIU Chun-san
Principal Assistant Secretary (Works) 2
Development Bureau

Mrs Sorais LEE KWAN Siu-kuen
Head (Kai Tak Office)
Civil Engineering and Development Department

Ms YING Fun-fong
Chief Engineer/Kowloon 3
Civil Engineering and Development Department

Agenda item VI

Miss Vivian LAU, JP
Deputy Secretary for the Environment

Mrs Dorothy MA
Principal Assistant Secretary for the Environment (Energy)2

Mr LI Kwok-keung
Assistant Director/Electricity and Energy Efficiency
Electrical and Mechanical Services Department

Mr MAK Ka-chun
Chief Engineer/Energy Efficiency B
Electrical and Mechanical Services Department

Agenda item VII

Mr Jimmy CHAN Pai-ming
Principal Assistant Secretary (Works)3
Development Bureau

Mr LEUNG Wing-lim

Assistant Director/New Works
Water Supplies Department

Mr Stephen CHING Kai-ming
Acting Chief Engineer/Design
Water Supplies Department

Agenda item VIII

Mr Thomas CHAN Chung-ching, JP
Deputy Secretary for Development
(Planning & Lands)1

Miss Elsa CHEUK Hau-kwan
Chief Town Planner/Special Duties
Planning Department

Mr Bosco CHAN Bun-pui
Deputy Project Manager (HK Island & Islands)
Civil Engineering and Development Department

Mr David LO Kwok-chung
Chief Engineer/Islands
Civil Engineering and Development Department

Clerk in attendance : Ms Sharon CHUNG
Chief Council Secretary (1)6

Staff in attendance : Mr Anthony CHU
Senior Council Secretary (1)6

Mr Fred PANG
Council Secretary (1)6

Ms Christina SHIU
Legislative Assistant (1)6

VIII Planning and Engineering Study on Future Land Use at the Ex-Lamma Quarry Area at Sok Kwu Wan, Lamma Island - Feasibility Study: Stage 1 Community Engagement

(LC Paper No. CB(1)428/12-13(08) -- Administration's paper on Planning and Engineering Study on Future Land Use at the Ex-Lamma Quarry Area at Sok Kwu Wan, Lamma Island -- Feasibility Study: Stage 1 Community Engagement)

124. To allow more time for discussion on the subject, members agreed that the Administration's briefing be skipped and the question-and-answer session would start right away. Members noted a submission, which was tabled at the meeting, from Dr Andy Cornish on the subject.

(Post-meeting note: A soft copy of the submission (LC Paper No. CB(1)462/12-13(01)) was circulated to members by email on 23 January 2013.)

Future land use at the ex-Lamma Quarry Area

Developing an eco park or a country park

125. Noting that under the proposed initial land use options for the ex-Lamma Quarry Area at Sok Ku Wan, Lamma Island ("the Site") as detailed in the Administration's paper, housing developments would be considered, Mr Albert CHAN cautioned that a piecemeal approach to increasing housing land supply might lead to mismatch between the attributes of a piece of land and its specified use. Based on his discussion with some local residents' groups on future use of the Site, Mr CHAN said that there was a strong opinion, supported by studies, for making use of the local ecological and cultural characteristics to develop the Site into an eco-tourism project, similar to the Eden Project in Cornwall, United Kingdom. Upon comparing the Site and the Eden Project, he found that the scales were similar, i.e. the former was 20 hectares ("ha") in size while the latter was 15 ha, and both were ex-quarries in the countryside. Given the small number of

residential units, i.e. 1 000 to 2 000, that could be provided under the initial land use options, he called on the Administration to seriously consider the suggestion to convert the Site, which was the only site in Hong Kong with characteristics similar to those of the Eden Project, into an eco park.

126. In response, Deputy Secretary for Development (Planning and Lands)¹ ("DS/DEV(P&L)1") said that the objective of the Stage 1 community engagement exercise ("Stage 1 CE"), which was in progress, for the Planning and Engineering Study on Future Land Use at the Ex-Lamma Quarry Area at Sok Kwu Wan, Lamma Island -- Feasibility Study ("the Study") was to seek the public's views on the proposed initial land use options. At this stage, the Administration kept an open mind to any suggestions on the future use of the Site. As the Site was one of the major potential sources of housing land supply in the short- to medium-term, it was important to conduct a planning study on how to optimize the use of the Site to meet the needs of society. The Planning Department and the Civil Engineering and Development Department had held informal discussions with local parties, green groups, professional institutions and other concern groups in March and April 2012. The three initial land use options proposed, covering the provision of both public and private housing, were arrived at based on the initial views collected during the discussions. He further said that the idea of an eco park, such as the Eden Project, had been considered but the Eden Project might not be an appropriate reference as, unlike the parks proposed in the land use options under the Study, it charged an entrance fee and its total area was larger than that of the Site. Recognizing that there were already some nature-themed parks in Hong Kong operated by the Administration, consideration might be given to incorporating some elements of the Eden Project into the future development at the Site. Mr CHAN said that according to his information, the area of the Site was larger than that of Eden Project.

127. Dr Fernando CHEUNG said that many local residents held the view that, albeit conducting a community engagement exercise, the Administration had already decided to allow for housing developments at the Site. However, they did not see the need to provide luxury flats and a marina, as proposed in the land use options. They queried whether the Administration would listen to and take on board their views on the future land use at the Site. He asked if the Administration would consider alternative land use options such as developing an eco park or a country

park, and through what channels local residents could make their voices heard.

128. DS/DEV(P&L)1 said that the Administration had proposed three initial land use options for the Stage 1 CE. The options covered not only housing developments, but also facilities such as an eco-tourism centre, parks, hotel and resort facilities, etc. The Administration would listen to and consider all public views, including the suggestion of incorporating certain elements of the Eden Project into the development of the Site. The views collected during the Stage 1 CE would provide essential inputs to the formulation of the preferred development options at the next stage of the Study.

129. Mr WU Chi-wai pointed out that, while he agreed to make the optimal use of land resources to ease the shortage in housing land, development of land should be considered on the suitability and the environment of individual sites. In view of the rural character of Lamma Island, he urged that the Administration should consider, as one of the potential land use options, converting the Site to a country park, retaining the natural resources as much as possible and making no land development. Miss Alice MAK opined that if a park was to be developed at the Site, in addition to reflecting the character of Lamma Island, there must be attractions for visitors, otherwise, the park might be under-utilized.

130. DS/DEV(P&L)1 emphasized that one of the objectives of the Stage 1 CE was to explore the optimal use of the Site and the Administration had an open mind to the views of members and the public. On the suggestion of converting the Site to an eco park or country park, he pointed out that the proposed land use options included the preservation of the man-made lake and, based on the preliminary recommendations of an ecological study, the conservation of attributes with ecological value.

Housing developments

131. Taking into account that Lamma Island was the second largest outlying island in Hong Kong, with an abundance of land resources, Mr CHAN Kam-lam supported that the Study should proceed expeditiously and the scope be expanded to include the planning for the whole island, not only confining to the Site. In his view, Lamma Island had great room for ecology conservation initiatives as well as

development of tourism, leisure facilities and housing. Noting that provision of subsidized and private housing at the Site had been proposed under the three initial land use options, he stressed the importance of providing sufficient employment opportunities on the island for the additional population intake.

132. Chief Town Planner/Special Duties, Planning Department ("CTP(SD)/PlanD") advised that housing developments were the major land uses in Options 1a and 1b, as set out in paragraphs 11 to 13 of the Administration's paper. Public views supporting the provision of both private and subsidized housing had been received. The ratio between the two types of housing would be examined at the next stage of the Study. For both options, a marketplace, retail and dining areas were included to attract visitors, enhance economic vitalities and provide employment opportunities.

133. Referring to the existing PRH developments at Tai O and Peng Chau, Mr WU Chi-wai asked about the Administration's observations of the problems, in particular those relating to transportation, faced by PRH residents on these outlying islands. He urged that the Administration should learn from experience to ensure that the residents of the future subsidized housing developments, if any, at the Site would not face the same problems.

134. Mr TANG Ka-piu pointed out that the demand for PRH on different outlying islands varied with the local situations. For instance, Cheung Chau indigenous villagers were not entitled to small houses, hence they were willing to move into PRH units to improve their living conditions. This explained why the occupancy rate of PRH at Cheung Chau was high. On the contrary, PRH units at Ping Chau were not in great demand as the living conditions of the indigenous villagers were better and more spacious. He highlighted the importance of consulting Lamma Island residents on their need for PRH. If it was decided that subsidized housing was to be provided on Lamma Island, relevant issues, such as connectivity, community facilities and employment opportunities had to be carefully planned. He expressed regret that under Option 1b, it was proposed that the scenic man-made lake had to be partially filled to allow for housing developments. He stressed the importance of making new developments compatible with the special characters of a place and integrate with the existing economic activities in an organic manner.

135. Dr Fernando CHEUNG shared Mr TANG Ka-piu's concern about the low demand for PRH on some outlying islands and cast doubt on whether PRH should be provided on Lamma Island.

136. Miss Alice MAK agreed that the Administration had to seriously study the demand for subsidized housing at the Site and the types of housing to be provided. Citing the case of Tung Chung, where many residents had given up job opportunities offered in other districts due to their concern about the high travelling expenses, she asked the Administration to ensure that there would be adequate employment opportunities on Lamma Island in future if subsidized housing would be provided. Otherwise, the demand for the housing units would be low, as the public would not prefer to spend a large portion of their income on travelling to and from their work places.

137. DS/DEV(P&L)1 said that the Administration welcomed members' and the public's views on the provision of subsidized housing at the Site and would follow up with the HKHA on the concerns about the demand for such housing. He added that during past discussions on the land use of the Site with local stakeholder groups, the Administration had received views that provision of subsidized housing should be explored. Concerning the integration of existing and new economic activities, and the provision of employment opportunities, he said that some of the proposed facilities, such as the parks, the hotel and the eco-tourism centre, would serve such purposes. However, as the scale of the future developments at the Site was not large, the number of jobs that could be provided would be limited.

[To allow sufficient time for discussion, the Chairman directed that the meeting be extended for 15 minutes]

Provision of leisure facilities

138. Mr TANG Ka-piu suggested that the Administration should consider incorporating some of the facilities, including a water sports centre and a hilltop observation deck, which were only included in Option 2, into Option 1a or 1b, so that these leisure facilities could be developed in parallel with housing projects. In response, DS/DEV(P&L)1 assured members that the Administration kept an open mind on the land use at the Site and would continue to listen to public views about the provision of different facilities therein.

External connectivity

139. Stressing that the transportation linkage between the future developments at the Site and the Hong Kong Island must be enhanced, Mr CHAN Kam-lam said that the new pier proposed to be constructed at the Site should have an adequate capacity to accommodate the increased number of commuters. For the longer-term planning, the Administration should explore the feasibility of constructing a tunnel to connect Lamma Island and the Hong Kong Island so as to provide greater room for the development of the former.

140. In response, CTP(SD)/PlanD advised that ferry services would be the major means of external transportation for the residents of the future developments at the Site. With the construction of the proposed new pier, the ferry services would be improved to cater for the residents' transportation needs. She noted Mr CHAN's view on the construction of a tunnel to connect Lamma Island and the Hong Kong Island.

141. Given that the population on Lamma Island would increase by at least 50% under the proposed land use options, Mr WU Chi-wai was concerned about the pressure that the enlarged population would exert on the transportation services. He opined that the increase in the population might not be sufficient to attain economy of scale for the operation of the enhanced ferry service. As a result, residents would have to pay high fares. He called on the Administration to ensure that, if the Site would be developed for housing and other uses, sufficient and affordable public transportation would be in place to serve the residents.

142. DS/DEV(P&L)1 considered that the increase in the number of passengers would likely enlarge the scale of the ferry services and enhance its viability. He advised that the Administration would look further into the transportation issues at the next stage of the Study.

143. In response to Mr WU's enquiry about whether there was a blueprint for the development of the whole Lamma Island, DS/DEV(P&L)1 said that the Lamma Island Outline Zoning Plan ("OZP") had been approved by the Town Planning Board. Under the Lamma Island OZP, there would be developments on the north side of the island, while the south side would be conserved to protect the

environment. As the Site was a major site zoned "Undetermined" on the OZP, the Administration had launched the Study to work out with stakeholders an optimal option for the use of the land resources at the Site.

Environmental impact assessment for the Site

144. Dr Fernando CHEUNG pointed out that, according to a local group, EIA for the Site had started in June 2011 but the report was not yet available. He asked whether and when the Administration would release the EIA Report. He also requested the Administration to consider conducting a social impact assessment for the proposed developments at the Site to examine how they would affect the social lives of the existing residents.

145. Deputy Project Manager (HK Island & Islands), Civil Engineering and Development Department clarified that the Director of Environmental Protection had issued an EIA Study Brief in July 2011. The EIA study, including an ecological survey, was in progress. The survey had been extended for six months, due to complete in early 2013. The EIA report would be prepared taking into account the findings of the survey. He assured members that the Administration would make the EIA Report public when it was completed.

IX Any other business

146. There being no other business, the meeting ended at 6:43 pm.

Council Business Division 1
Legislative Council Secretariat
21 March 2013

Appendix 6:

Minutes of Land and Development Advisory Committee (Planning Sub-committee) Meeting

**Draft Minutes of the
82nd Meeting of the Planning Sub-Committee (PSC) of
the Land and Development Advisory Committee (LDAC)
held on 30.1.2013 (Wednesday) at 2:30 p.m.
in Room 1707, 17/F, North Point Government Offices**

Present :	Mr. K. K. Ling	PlanD	(Chairman)
	Mr. Edwin Tsang	HKIS	
	Mr. P. Y. Tam	HKIP	
	Ms. Susan Leung	HKIA	
	Mr. Alexander Duggie	HKILA	
	Mr. Shuki Leung	REDA	
	Ir. Thomas Ho	HKCA	
	Mr. Ma Kim See	AAP	
	Ir. Siu Yin-wai	HKIE	
	Mr. Alan Lo	LandsD	
	Mr. Victor Yeung	EPD	
	Mr. Harry H Y Chan	HD	
	Ms. Phyllis Li	PlanD	
	Mr. W.Y. Lam	PlanD	(Secretary)
In attendance:	Miss Elsa Cheuk	PlanD	} PSC Paper No. 1/2013
	Mr. Timothy Lui	PlanD	
	Mr. David K. C. Lo	CEDD	
	Ms. Theresa Yeung	Consultant	
	Mr. Wai-lam Lee	Consultant	
	Mr. Paul Leader	Consultant	
Absent with : Apologies	Mr. James Fan	REDA	
	Miss Ophelia Wong	PlanD	
	Mr. Kepler Yuen	DEVB	
	Mr. Edward Li	CEDD	
	Ms. Ioan Sham	HD	

1. Introduction

- 1.1 The Chairman welcomed members to the meeting. The meeting noted that Mr. James Fan of REDA, Miss Ophelia Wong of PlanD, Mr. Kepler Yuen of DEVB, Mr. Edward Li of CEDD and Miss Iona Sham of HD had informed the Secretary that they were unable to attend the meeting due to other work commitments.

2. **Item 1 Planning and Engineering Study on Future Land Use at the Ex-Lamma Quarry Area at Sok Kwu Wan, Lamma Island – Feasibility Study: Stage 1 Community Engagement (PSC Paper No. 1/2013)**

2.1 The Chairman welcomed representatives of PlanD, CEDD and the consultants attending the meeting. Miss Elsa Cheuk said that the Integrated Planning and Engineering Study at the Ex-Lamma Quarry (the Study) commenced in January 2012 and the Stage 1 Community Engagement (CE) of the Study aimed at seeking public views on the initial land use options for the Ex-Lamma Quarry Area (the Study Site) which was zoned “Undetermined” on the Lamma Island OZP.

Overview of Study

2.2 With the aid of a PowerPoint presentation, Ms. Theresa Yeung briefed members that the objective of the Study was to examine the development potential of the Study Site and its feasibility for residential and other compatible uses. She added that work on the baseline review of the Study Site, establishment of the guiding principles and the option formulation and associated technical assessments, etc., had been completed. The Stage 1 CE, which commenced on 7.12.2012 and would last until 6.2.2013, would seek public views on the initial land use options. The consultants would then formulate the preferred land use options, undertake the relevant technical assessments, prepare the preliminary outline development plan (PODP) for the Stage 2 CE to be scheduled in end 2013. Work on finalising the recommended ODP and the implementation arrangements was anticipated to complete in late 2014 .

Study Site and Vision and Guiding Principles

2.3 Ms. Theresa Yeung informed members that the Study Site covered about

34 ha, which comprised 3 platforms with a total area of about 20 ha and a man-made lake of about 5 ha. The Study Site also abutted the coast and was close to three fish culture zones in Sok Kwu Wan to its south. Having regard to the unique characteristics of the Study Site, its geographical setting, the identified guiding principles, namely, development needs, local aspirations, environment and infrastructure, the Study proposed a vision to create a green and sustainable waterfront neighbourhood at the Study Site. She pointed out that the formulation of the initial land use options was based on the following design components:

- provide future developments on existing platform areas;
- preserve existing natural vegetation;
- protect visual connection to the natural backdrop of the Study Site from major vantage points;
- provide visual relief to the building clusters and extend the existing greenery to the waterfront by providing the Lakeside Park and Woodland Park;
- enhance both external and internal connectivity of the Study Site;
- provide a continuous waterfront promenade for public enjoyment;
- adopt stepped height profile for buildings descending towards the waterfront;
- provide subsidised and private housing; and
- provide supporting G/IC facilities for the future development.

Initial Land Use Options

2.4 Ms Theresa Yeung stated that two initial land use options, namely ‘Seaside Living’ (i.e. housing) and ‘Seaside Paradise’ (i.e. tourism plus housing), were proposed. A mix of housing types including private housing with a portion of subsidised housing had been proposed at the Study Site to meet the imminent housing demand, the development would be provided with a woodland park, a lakeside park, marina and local G/IC facilities. The two initial options, with a flat size ranging from 50m² to 100m² would produce 2,000 to 2,800 flats for 5,000 to 7,000 persons (Options 1a and 1b) and 1,000 flats for 2,800 persons (Option 2)

respectively. Except for Option 1b, which required partial filling of the man-made lake, developments would be confined at the 3 existing platforms. The proposed plot ratios for the developments were 0.6 to 1.8 for Option 1a, 0.75 to 2.0 for Option 1b and 0.6 to 1.5 for Option 2. The key design features of the initial land use options proposed were as follows:

Options 1a and 1b

- an entrance plaza was proposed in front of the new pier to host public activities, such as exhibition stalls to attract residents and visitors;
- an eco-tourism centre was proposed at the southern edge of the artificial lake for appreciation of the natural landscape;
- a community square was proposed at the northern platform for commercial uses together with outdoor dining facilities for public gathering purpose;
- the building height will range from 4 to 10 storeys for option 1a and 4 to 12 storeys for option 1b; and
- option 1b would require additional land via partial filling of the man-made lake.

Option 2

- low-rise resort hotel facilities was proposed along the lakefront and hillside in the north;
- a sizable event plaza (labelled as ‘Lamma Hub’) surrounded by low-rise commercial spaces for hosting festive events was proposed next to the new ferry pier;
- a water sports centre was proposed to at the southern part of the man-made lake; and
- a stepped height profile was proposed with low-rise building at the waterfront and taller buildings with a maximum of 8 storeys at sites in the inland.

Accessibility and Connectivity

2.5 Ms Theresa Yeung continued to brief members on the proposals to enhance the connectivity of the Study Site as follows:

- a new pier was proposed at the mid-point of the Study Site to provide boarding facilities for existing ferry services operated between

Central/Aberdeen and Sok Kwu Wan Pier;

- new hiking trails were proposed to link up the Study Site with other parts of Lamma Island with an alternative pedestrian corridor to connect with the Lo So Shing/Sok Kwu Wan area;
- cycle tracks and pedestrian walkways were provided throughout the Study Site to serve the development sites; and
- a tree-lined access corridor running along the south-western to north-eastern end was proposed within the Study Site; and
- viability of providing shuttle services within the Study Site would be further investigated.

2.6 Ms Theresa Yeung further said that the initial land use options were posted in the Study website for public comments. The Stage 1 CE also included briefings to District Councils, statutory bodies/committees and professional institutes; roving exhibitions, community workshop and public forum. Public views on the initial land use options collected in the Stage 1 CE would provide essential inputs to the formulation of the preferred development option at the next stage of the Study.

Discussions

2.7 Ir. Siu Yin-wai said that the Study Site should be better utilised to help meeting the imminent housing need, including public housing. Though local people preferred preservation and low density developments, more intensive developments and activities would make the Study Site a gateway to the Lamma Island.

2.8 Mr. P Y Tam stated that the future land use of the Study Site required a strategic decision as the Study Site at Lamma Island might not be suitable for public housing and the proposed development density was more akin to high-class housing in all options. He opined that the quantum of development should be sustainable and consideration should be given to examine other beneficial uses, such as research institutions, hospital, spa hotel, etc., that could bring about least impact to Lamma Island and

achieve the greatest benefit. On the proposed water sports centre in Option 2, he pointed out that the future management of the facility of such a scale might be an issue.

- 2.9 Mr. Alexander Duggie said that from a strategic viewpoint, the site was a self-contained entity and its future development was dependent on the population threshold supported by available infrastructural capacity and transport linkages to the Hong Kong Island. He added that he had no preference on the land use options as they were similar in nature and he supported the stepped height design and suggested the provision of an internal bus system and a fire services access which might serve also Sok Kwu Wan.
- 2.10 Mr. Ma Kim-see remarked that the Study Site was not suitable for mass housing due to its isolated location, infrastructural and transport constraints. He further asked whether the G/IC facilities would include elderly village; whether there was any development agency and phasing of the proposed resort; and whether there were scope to expand the Study Site with more development opportunities.
- 2.11 Mr. Edwin Tsang expressed concern that the air pollution caused by the Hong Kong Electric power plant might affect the proposed development at the Study Site. He suggested that consideration should be given to further reclaim land to the north of Lamma Island as the proposed land use options which accommodated about only 5,000 to 7,000 persons were insufficient to meeting the housing need.
- 2.12 Ms. Susan Leung had the following comments on the land use options:
- the proposed developments should integrate with those in Sok Kwu Wan;
 - as the shoreline was ideal for resort development, land for resort in Option 2 should take up the entire man-made lake. In addition, the

residential portion and the sewage treatment works at the north-eastern part should be removed;

- the proposed residential flats with flat sizes of 50 - 100 m² might neither be affordable to subsidized housing residents nor appealing to high-end residents;
- there should be retail kiosk and spectator stand for the proposed water sports centre;
- water quality of the man-made lake should be up to standard for recreation use; and
- no objection to partially fill up the man-made lake proposed in Option 1b.

2.13 Mr. Shuki Leung said that he had no objection to the green sustainable community concept of the Study. From a strategic viewpoint, he pointed out that the housing development would not benefit local residents. Rather, he inclined to adopt a mixed use approach to introduce a wide variety of G/IC and commercial uses. With the increased population in future, the Study Site would create an important node, with enhanced transportation links to the future MTR connection in Aberdeen/Ap Lei Chau to serve future urban dwellers as well as local residents of Lamma Island. Enhancing connectivity of the Study Site to Hong Kong Island would serve to overcome the existing constraints and more development opportunities would be explored including increasing the development density. On the initial land use options, he had no strong views on stepped height profile and considered that the overall design character should be considered first. Moreover, he was concerned about the connectivity between the old and new areas, the water quality of the man-made lake and the maintenance cost for future public recreation uses and the impact of the marina development on the adjoining fish culture zones.

2.14 Ms. Phyllis Li remarked that located close to the Island South, the Study Site might be suitable for resort hotel and tourism development with its synergy with the nearby tourism development, such as the Ocean Park via

a possible ferry link as well as a future MTR link to Central. Views from the tourism sector should be sought as input to the Study.

- 2.15 By referring to existing ferry services of Discovery Bay and Ma Wan, Ir. Siu Yin-wai stated that future ferry services serving both the working class and tourists to the resort hotel of the Study Site should be more affordable to make the development feasible. Furthermore, he expressed concern on the water quality of the man-made lake for recreation use and the attraction of the Study Site to working class and high-end residents as well as tourists.
- 2.16 Mr. Alexander Duggie supplemented that there were people fond of living on outlying islands and the provision of a quick transport link to Central via the future MTR would be the key to overcome the constraint on future development of the Study Site.
- 2.17 Miss Elsa Cheuk and Ms. Theresa Yeung responded to members' comments as follows:
- the Study had taken into account previous development strategies, the Policy Address, uniqueness of the Study Site and local views in formulating development themes as well as the initial land use options for the Stage 1 CE. Views from the local residents, the tourism sector and the public received would be taken into account in formulating the preferred land use option for the Stage 2 CE;
 - the Study Site had infrastructure and transport constraints, mass public housing had not been considered feasible. A variety of choices for good quality housing, including some form of subsidized housing, at the 20 ha platform of the Study Site for a population threshold of about 7,000 persons had been proposed for public comments, and the next stage of the Study would assess the feasibility of the proposed land

uses;

- a ferry schedule assessment had been undertaken and the result shown that with the construction of the new public pier and increase of ferry schedule, it would be able to sustain a further population of 5,000 – 7,000 proposed for the Study Site. Reference could also be made to Cheung Chau with a population of over 20,000 and Yung Shue Wan with a population of over 5,500.
- preliminary technical assessments showed that through improvements to the existing infrastructure (including the provision of a new fire station, an on-site sewage treatment plant, etc.), the initial land use options would be feasible. Moreover, some form of electric vehicles might be provided to connect the developments of the Study Site with the new public pier; and
- the water quality of the man-made lake would be further studied as the proposed development was subject to EIA Ordinance.

2.18 Citing Cheung Chau as an example, Mr. Alexander Duggie said that with the new public pier, opportunities should also be explored to intensify the residential sites which had a proposed building height of only 4 to 12 storeys and for the public's consideration. The Chairman stated that major source of flat supply should come from the NENT and NWNT NDAs.

2.19 As members had no further comments, the Chairman thanked members for their valuable comments. He also thanked the representatives of PlanD, CEDD and the consultants for the briefing. They left the meeting at this juncture.

3. Item 2 Matters Arising from Minutes of Last Meeting held on 6.9.2012

3.1 The Secretary reported that the draft minutes of last meeting, which had incorporated members' comments as appropriate, had been confirmed and a copy of the confirmed minutes was circulated to members on 4.12.2012.

3.2 He further reported that there was no matter arising from the minutes of the last meeting and he briefed the meeting on the latest position of the two items discussed at the last meeting as follows:

Stage 1 Public Engagement (PE) of the Preliminary Urban Renewal Proposals for Kowloon City (PSC Paper 4/2012)

- A total of 301 written comments were received and a survey with 1,222 questionnaires was also completed during the engagement period. The Stage 1 PE Report was accepted by the Kowloon City District Urban Renewal Forum (KC DURF) at its meeting on 12.12.2012 and was uploaded to the dedicated website for the Urban Renewal Plan for Kowloon City.
- The Draft Urban Renewal Plan for Kowloon City (DURP) taking into account the public views received in the Stage 1 PE and the result of the Stage 1 Assessment of the Social Impact Assessment was being prepared. The Stage 2 PE for the DURP would tentatively schedule for commencement in the 1st quarter of 2013 the earliest and the various studies would complete in 2013.

North East New Territories Development Areas Planning and Engineering Study – Recommended Outline Development Plans and Stage Three Public Engagement (PSC Paper No. 5/2012)

- The public comments on the NENT NDAs Study collected during the Stage 3 Public Engagement (PE3) exercise were being analysed. The development proposals were being revised taking into account comments received. Various technical assessments (including environmental assessments) had been conducted to ascertain feasibility of the revised proposals.
- The revised development proposals, together with the PE3 Report, would be announced in the first half of 2013. The statutory planning procedure and other preparation work associated with the development project for the NENT NDA would then follow.

4. Any Other Business

- 4.1 Mr. Edwin Tsang remarked that the PSC meeting seemed to focus on discussion of planning consultancy studies and he wished to make more contributions on other topics, such as housing land supply, parking standards, development density, etc.
- 4.2 In response, the Chairman welcomed members suggesting topics for discussion. Members could inform the Secretary any suggested topics they wish to discuss at formal meetings of PSC. He added that an informal gathering might also facilitate exchange of views.
- 4.3 Both Mr. Shuki Leung and Ir. Siu Yin-wai considered that with their respective background in the development industry, they might give useful contributions/advice to Government on future development strategies as well as their implementation. Mr. P. Y. Tam added that the professional institutes might be given opportunities to contribute in the envisioning work of the consultancy studies. Mr. Alexander Duggie said that members should help to review/formulate development options, but not to choose between them.
- 4.4 The Chairman appreciated members' proactive attitude and frank exchange of views about the PSC. He said that members' views on the development options would be duly taken into account and the recommended option would be a hybrid one hoping to strike a balance between all views received. He thanked members for lending very good support to PSC and agreed that members should be given the earliest possible opportunities to be consulted on the future consultancy studies.
- 4.5 There being no other business, the meeting closed at 4:25 p.m.

Appendix 7:

Minutes of Southern District Council Meeting (Extracted)

**Minutes of the 7th Meeting of the
District Development and Environment Committee (DDEC)
Southern District Council (SDC)**

Date : 4 February 2013
Time : 2:30 p.m.
Venue : SDC Conference Room

Present:

Mr CHU Ching-hong, JP (Chairman of SDC)
Mr CHAN Fu-ming, MH (Vice-Chairman of SDC)
Mr LAM Kai-fai, MH (Chairman of DDEC)
Mrs MAK TSE How-ling, Ada (Vice-Chairlady of DDEC)
Mr AU Lap-sing
Mr AU Nok-hin
Mr CHAI Man-hon
Mrs CHAN LEE Pui-ying
Ms CHEUNG Sik-yung
Mr CHU Lap-wai
Mr FUNG Wai-kwong
Ms LAM Yuk-chun, MH
Mr LO Kin-hei
Mr TSUI Yuen-wa
Dr YANG Mo, PhD
Mr YEUNG Wai-foon, MH, JP
Mr Paul ZIMMERMAN
Mr CHAN Man-chun
Mr LEE Kwan-keung
Mr LAU Kar-wah
Dr MUI Heung-fu, Dennis

Apologies for Absence:

Mr FUNG Se-goun, Fergus

Dr LIU Hong-fai, Dandy

Mr WONG Ling-sun, Vincent

Mr TSOI Chi-chung, Raymond

Secretary:

Miss CHENG Kwan-wai, Vivian Executive Officer (District Council) 2,
Southern District Office, Home Affairs Department

In Attendance:

Miss NG Kai-ting, Nettie Assistant District Officer (Southern),
Home Affairs Department

Miss LIN Ming Senior Executive Officer (District Council),
Southern District Office,
Home Affairs Department

Mr CHAN Siu-wing, Andrew Executive Officer I (District Management),
Southern District Office,
Home Affairs Department

Mr CHEUNG Chin-hung, Jason Senior Engineer 4 (Hong Kong Island Division 2),
Civil Engineering and Development Department

Dr LEE Wai-tak, Anthony Senior Environmental Protection Officer
(Regional South) 3,
Environmental Protection Department

Mr WONG Hung-yuen Chief Health Inspector,
Southern District Environmental Hygiene Office,
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department

Mr WONG Sun-man Housing Manager/Hong Kong 4,
Housing Department

Ms TAM Wai-chu, Rachel Deputy District Leisure Manager (Southern) 1,
Leisure and Cultural Services Department

Ms LOU Yin-yee, Joanne Senior Estate Surveyor/South (District Lands Office,
Hong Kong West and South),
Lands Department

Miss YIU Yuk, Isabel Senior Town Planner/HK 1,
Planning Department

Attending by Invitation (Agenda Item 2):

Mr NG Ka-shu Senior Town Planner/HK 5,
Planning Department

Attending by Invitation (Agenda Item 3 – Follow-up Item 4):

Mr KAM Wing-kee Chief Engineer/HK & Islands,
Water Supplies Department

Mr LAU Wing-keung Chief Engineer/HK 2,
Water Supplies Department

Mr WAN Wai-yin Engineer/HK (Distribution 6),
Water Supplies Department

Attending by Invitation (Agenda Item 3 – Follow-up Item 8):

Miss KO Wai-kwan, Vivian Commissioner for Heritage,
Development Bureau

Miss LEE Lai-kwan, Queenie Assistant Secretary (Heritage Conservation) 3,
Development Bureau

Mr Alnwick CHAN Executive Director, Auction, Land Advisory Services,
Valuations,
Knight Frank Hong Kong

Attending by Invitation (Agenda Item 4):

Miss CHEUK Hau-kwan, Elsa Chief Town Planner/Special Duties,
Planning Department

Mr LUI Yu-man, Timothy Senior Town Planner/Special Duties 1,
Planning Department

Mr LO Kwok-chung, David Chief Engineer/Islands, HK Island and Islands
Development Office,
Civil Engineering and Development Department

Mr CHAU Kwok-leung, Eddie Engineer 11 (Islands Division), HK Island and Islands
Development Office,
Civil Engineering and Development Department

Ms Theresa YEUNG Project Manager (Planning),
Ove Arup & Partners Hong Kong Ltd.

Agenda Item 4: Planning and Engineering Study on Future Land Use at the Ex-Lamma Quarry Area at Sok Kwu Wan, Lamma Island - Feasibility Study (Stage 1 Community Engagement)

(Item raised by Planning Department and Civil Engineering and Development Department)

(DDEC Paper No. 2/2013)

87. The Chairman welcomed the following representatives from government departments and consultancy company to the meeting:

Planning Department

- . Miss CHEUK Hau-kwan, Chief Town Planner/Special Duties
- . Mr LUI Yu-man, Senior Town Planner/Special Duties 1

HK Island and Islands Development Office, Civil Engineering and Development Department

- . Mr LO Kwok-chung, Chief Engineer/Islands
- . Mr CHAU Kwok-leung, Engineer 11 (Islands Division)

Ove Arup & Partners Hong Kong Ltd.

- . Ms Theresa YEUNG, Project Manager (Planning)

88. The Chairman thanked the departments concerned and consultancy company for their strenuous efforts in preparing for the meeting, nonetheless, due to the packed agenda items, he wished that the presentation could be finished within 10 minutes so that Members could have sufficient time to discuss areas of prime concern.

89. Ms Theresa YEUNG, with the aid of PowerPoint presentation (Reference Paper 1), briefly introduced the two initial land use options for public's comment in the Stage One Community Engagement.

90. Mr CHU Ching-hong, JP, Mr CHAN Fu-ming, MH, Mr CHAI Man-hon, Mrs CHAN LEE Pui-ying, Mrs MAK TSE How-ling, Mr TSUI Yuen-wa, Dr YANG Mo, PhD and Mr Paul ZIMMERMAN raised comments and enquiries on the subject as follows:

Development Needs

- (a) For the interest of Hong Kong as a whole, and in the face of population growth, as well as shortages in housing and land supply, the proposed land uses could be a feasible option to increase housing supply in the long run. Nevertheless, as far as the Southern District was concerned, it would inevitably cause certain misgivings. It was hoped that related departments could further consider SDC's concerns on the proposed land uses;
- (b) recognised the development needs of Lamma Island and lent full support to the proposed land uses. It was suggested that the external accessibility of Lamma Island could be enhanced by leveraging on the existing piers and MTR station at South Horizons; and
- (c) to cope with the needs of future economic growth of Hong Kong, the departments concerned should consider other land uses such as the development of universities, convention centres, hotels and casinos on Lamma Island.

Traffic Impact on Southern District

- (a) At present, the Southern District served as an interchange hub for many people to/from Lamma Island. There were concerns over the effects of the proposed land uses on the Southern District, especially in the neighbourhood of Aberdeen. It was also asked whether an analysis had been carried out regarding the existing and projected people flow between Aberdeen and Lamma Island by ferry, "kai-to" or other transport means, availability of a park-and-ride car park and

passenger pick-up/drop-off points, as well as the traffic impact of the proposed land uses;

- (b) it was believed that one of the reasons for indigenous residents of Lamma Island to support residential development on the island was that they hoped to adjust ferry frequency through population growth on the island. Currently, people relied on ferry services to/from Lamma Island/Central, and Lamma Island/Aberdeen respectively. Central was a central business district, served with a large-scale public transport interchange, which could cope with the extra traffic flow arising from the population growth on Lamma Island. However, Aberdeen lacked comprehensive transport facilities to interchange for MTR or other transport means, on top of this, residents on Lamma Island normally used feeder services at Aberdeen for access to other places. In the light of the frequent traffic congestions at the Aberdeen Tunnel, it was worried that the population growth and increase in ferry frequency would greatly burden the overall traffic conditions in the Southern District; and
- (c) the departments concerned should carry out a detailed district-specific TIA to survey on matters such as traffic facilities in Aberdeen and infrastructural facilities that could cope with the population growth on Lamma Island before proceeding further study on the proposed land uses.

Impact on Lamma Island

- (a) Due to typological characteristics, Lamma Island lacked comprehensive surface transport facilities, which might impede its development as a low-density residential area or tourist attraction;
- (b) the current population of Lamma Island was about 6 000. However, under the proposed land use options, the population would be increased by around one-fold in future. This drastic population growth would burden community facilities and transport facilities on the island;
- (c) under Option 2, the potential increase in population would exert less pressure on the island, but there was worry that the island would become a private luxury residential or resort area, which could not meet the genuine housing demand in Hong Kong, and even barred the general public from the beautiful scenery on Lamma Island;

- (d) the proposed building heights under Options 1a, 1b and 2 would be deemed ideal in the urban area. Nevertheless, the existing buildings on Lamma Island were generally three to four storeys, and the construction of buildings up to eight to 12 storeys would adversely affect the existing development mode, life style and natural landscape of the island. Endowed with a leisurely rural ambience, Lamma Island had distinguished itself as a tourist destination and holiday getaway, while islanders also wished to continue to enjoy a comfortable and leisure living environment. Therefore, an extensive development mode and the proposed building heights were not supported; and
- (e) if a private sector development mode was adopted across-the-board, the above worries would become a reality. Therefore, for the time being, the proposed land uses was not supported, pending for further information.

Others

- (a) Given the proximity of the Southern District and Lamma Island, local residents in the Southern District frequently enjoyed their leisure on Lamma Island, and their patronage had accounted for a large portion of the visitors of the island. As such, the departments concerned should take SDC's views into account when considering an extensive long-term development plan on Lamma Island;
- (b) fishery industry was of utmost importance to Lamma Island and the Southern District, thus there were concerns over the possible impact of the proposed land uses on mariculture rafts; and
- (c) take Stanley as an example, at the initial stage of a new development area, it was necessary for the Government to construct public and subsidised housing estates to ensure that a population was built up to support the infrastructural development of the community, while it took time to construct other community facilities such as schools and tourist facilities. In this regard, it was suggested that the departments concerned could make reference to the development mode of other similar regions, and provide further information for the discussion of SDC.

92. Miss CHEUK Hau-kwan gave a consolidated response as follows:

Traffic Impact on Southern District

- (a) At present, there were ferry services to/from Lamma Island and Aberdeen. The consultant was considering various transport facilities options, including the provision of additional piers on the island and optimisation of the surface transport system connecting Sok Kwu Wan and Lo So Shing, with a view to enhancing the accessibility of Lamma Island; and
- (b) the development sites at the ex-Lamma Quarry Area would be gradually available after 2020, and by that time, MTR SIL would be put into operation. The consultant would carry out a detailed TIA on the future traffic conditions at the next stage of the Study.

Impact on Lamma Island

- (a) Stage 1 Community Engagement aimed at consulting the public on the two initial land use options (i.e. Options 1a, 1b and 2). On housing supply, both subsidised housing and private housing would be provided under the two options, but public rental housing was excluded in the proposal. PlanD was collecting public comments on the mix of housing types and a conclusion including the implementation arrangement had yet to be drawn up. Further study would be carried out at the later stage of the Study;
- (b) PlanD noted Members' concerns on the proposed building heights and density. To integrate with the overall environment of the ex-Lamma Quarry Area and its surroundings, after initial assessments, it was proposed that under Options 1a and 1b, a stepped height profile with low-rise buildings of four storeys near the waterfront and taller buildings with a maximum height of 12 storeys near the mountain backdrop would be adopted to preserve the natural ridgeline and a reasonable degree of visual permeability. In this way, based on the preliminary assessments conducted, the ridgeline would not be obstructed by buildings from major vantage points. PlanD would proceed an in-depth study on the types of housing, the mix of housing types and density at the next stage; and
- (c) Lamma Island was not only a popular tourist attraction for visitors from the Mainland and overseas, but also one of the tourist hotspots for

Hong Kong people. Coupled with its proximity to the Ocean Park, PlanD had come up with Option 2 which featured “tourism cum housing” as its conceptual development theme, with a view to enhancing the tourism appeal of Lamma Island as a tourist centre in the Southern District, so that visitors would have more choices. To complement the tourist resort setting, the artificial lake would be opened for public use, and tourist facilities such as a waterfront promenade, water sports centre and eco-tourism centre would be built for public enjoyment. Details of the facilities would be studied at the next stage.

Others

- (a) PlanD would take all comments collected during the current stage of public engagement into account when taking forward the study at the next stage; and
- (b) based on the environmental impact assessment (EIA) study and sustainability study, PlanD would assess the impact of the proposed land uses on water quality and fish culture zones in the district at the next stage.

93. Ms Theresa YEUNG gave a supplementary response as follows:

Traffic Impact on Southern District

- (a) Currently Sok Kwu Wan and Yung Shue Wan had a population of around 500 and 6 000 respectively. According to the statistics provided by related department, during Sundays, the one-way daily patronage of Aberdeen/Sok Kwu Wan route and Aberdeen/Yung Shue Wan route was about 200 and 500 respectively, and on the same day, the one-way daily patronage of Central/Sok Kwu Wan route and Central/Yung Shue Wan route was about 500 and 4 000 respectively. The main reason for this patronage pattern was that the ferry schedule for Yung Shue Wan was more frequent than that of Sok Kwu Wan, and the scheduled frequency interval was around 30 minutes for the former and over an hour for the latter;
- (b) owing to the fact that most residents on Lamma Island went to Central for work or public feeder service to other destinations, coupled with

the convenient “kai-to” services to/from Aberdeen and Lamma Island, future ferry services would focus on the Lamma Island/Central route;

- (c) the consultancy company had studied the proposal of providing a public pier at South Horizons. Given that most of the sites along the Ap Lei Chau waterfront were private land, or government land on lease for purposes such as driving school, oil depot, etc., the public pier would be located a bit far away from the proposed MTR station. Taking into account the daily patronage of only about 500 nos. on Sundays from Yung Shue Wan to Aberdeen that is catered by existing the “kai-to” services, the provision of an additional public pier might not be appropriate; and
- (d) a detailed TIA on the future traffic conditions would be carried out at the next stage.

Impact on Lamma Island

- (a) At present, Lamma Island was a car-free community. The departments concerned had organised three public forums/workshop to gauge public views, and most of the views wished that the car-free environment could be preserved. Therefore, under the proposed land use options, apart from the emergency vehicular access, no vehicular access would be provided on the island;
- (b) in future, people could travel via the pedestrian corridor at the waterfront for access to/from Lo So Shing, or use the hiking trails to/from various places on the island. Also, at present, “kai-to” services were available to connect Sok Kwu Wan and Yung Shue Wan; and
- (c) would continue to study whether the transport facilities would burden Lamma Island.

Others

- (a) The possible impact of the proposed land uses on mariculture rafts and the surrounding environment would be handled carefully; and
- (b) a detailed EIA would be carried out to ascertain the possible impact on water quality, surrounding environment and mariculture rafts according to the Environmental Impact Assessment Ordinance, and an EIA report would be submitted to EPD.

94. Mr TSUI Yuen-wa and Mr Paul ZIMMERMAN continued to raise comments and enquiries as follows:

- (b) marina facilities and a “Comprehensive Development Area” (CDA) were included in all options (i.e. Options 1a, 1b and 2), and it was wished that further details would be provided;
- (b) it was rumoured that the Government planned to construct a bridge connecting Lamma Island and the Southern District, and an artificial island would be built in between for providing residential sites. It was asked whether the said proposal was true;
- (c) under the proposed land uses, the future population on Lamma Island would be nearly doubled, and would concentrate in the neighbourhood of Sok Kwu Wan close to Aberdeen. It was opined that the department concerned had underestimated the future people flow between Lamma Island and Aberdeen. With the increase in people flow in future, it was necessary to provide a standard public pier in the Southern District; and
- (d) the department concerned should explain the transport facilities arrangements under each land use options. Since departments concerned had not provided sufficient information at the moment, Members could not advise on the population target, and therefore could not support the proposed land use options in a hasty manner.

95. The Chairman invited the departments concerned to note SDC’s concerns.

96. Miss CHEUK Hau-kwan gave a supplementary response as follows:

- (a) Lamma Island had a high tourism appeal, and a public marina was proposed to take the advantage of the quality waterfront;
- (b) the said CDA was outside the study site. Since the CDA was located to the west of the quarry, it was included into study area. According to the existing OZP, the CDA was intended for residential use, and was compatible with the proposed uses in the ex-Lamma Quarry Area;
- (c) under the initial land use options, the planned population ranged from 2 800 (Option 2) to 7 000 (Option 1b). After the completion of Stage 1 Public Engagement, PlanD would proceed to work out specific details such as the implementation arrangement, projected population,

types of housing, etc, and carry out a TIA in order to formulate specific feeder arrangements; and

- (d) ferry frequency would be increased to cope with the population growth. Therefore, a new stop for the Sok Kwu Wan/Central route in the midway was proposed. PlanD would further study the traffic impact of the land use options on Aberdeen and Ap Lei Chau.

97. Mr LO Kwok-chung clarified that presently the Government had no plan to construct a bridge connecting Lamma Island and Aberdeen or Ap Lei Chau.

98. The Chairman invited the departments concerned to note the views of DDEC, especially on the traffic impacts of the proposed land use options on traffic conditions in the district. He requested the departments concerned to consult SDC as soon as possible if and when there was further information concerning the Southern District.

Appendix 8:

Gist of Major Comments from the meeting with Lamma (North) Rural Committee

Planning and Engineering Study on Future Land Use at Ex-Lamma Quarry Area at Sok Kwu Wan, Lamma Island – Feasibility Study

Quick Gist on the Meeting Lamma North Rural Committee on 20 February, 2013 at Lamma North Rural Committee Office

1. Participants

Mr. Chan Lin Wai, Chairman of Lamma (North) Rural Committee and Island DC member

Mr. Chow Hing Fook, Vice- Chairman of Lamma (North) Rural Committee

Ms. Yu Lai Fun, Executive Committee member of Lamma (North) Rural Committee and Island DC member

2. Issues Discussed

2.1 Development Themes

The Lamma (North) Rural Committee gave support to the development at the Ex-Lamma Quarry. It was pointed out that ELQ was not a natural feature and it would be very selfish not to develop the piece of land.

Housing

The site should be developed with suitable density. Unlike Cheung Chau which had more than 20,000 people, Lamma had over 1420 ha and should be able to accommodate more population. However, it should not be developed by single developer like Discovery Bay or Ma Wan where people were not encouraged to walk inside the development freely. Instead, it should be an open community, with private and subsidized housing and other facilities.

With regard to the need for housing on Lamma and the vacancy issues, it was pointed out that the vacancy rate in Lamma was very low. The development of 12 houses by King Wong at Nga Kau Wan had been left vacant since it was built because the landowner bided the land for \$70m before 1997 and now asked an unreasonable price of \$20,000 per sq ft in a whole lot; therefore it was not occupied. While this had raised the property price for other houses and gave a bad excuse for vacant flat.

Tourism

It was considered that Lamma had a lot of tourism resources, they include:

1. 35 windmills to be built by 2015 near Ha Mei Wan in South Lamma

2. There are also rocks of strange shapes at Ling Kok Shan and green turtles in South Lamma
3. Coastal scenic footpath from Pak Kok in the North Lamma to Lo Tik Wan, Luk Chau and to South Lamma
4. The 12 villages in Lamma North and Lamma South had their own features and Fung Shui Woodland

Hong Kong needed more scenic spots. The local village roads, jetty, toilets and tourism facilities should be enhanced to increase the attractiveness of Lamma and Hong Kong as a whole, and to increase local employment.

2.2 Facilities and Land Use

Marina

Marina was not supported as Sok Kwu Wan was like a ‘bottleneck’ not suitable for boat berthing, and will affect the fish farming.

Man-made Lake

It was suggested that the lake should be for amenity enhancement and also allow the young people to play and enjoy.

Hotel

G/IC uses

It was understood that the increase in population would not benefit the Lamma North population as any community facilities in South Lamma would be too far away for their use.

However, it was pointed out that the population in Lamma South should be more than 6,000 as shown in the Census. There were over 4,000 electricity meters which gave evident that the population should be above 10,000. Therefore, giving more community facilities to Lamma South which would have less population even with the ELQ development would not be fair to Lamma North and the public money spent would be queried by local population. It was pointed out that services to ensure ‘safety net’ such as emergency vehicular access should be provided in Lamma North, which should not be over-ruled by the minority.

2.3 Justifications for Development

It was suggested that the proposed development should be well justified by:

- research data on environmental and ecological conservation
- Legal framework and procedures;
- Policy support and
- Fair use of public money and resources

It was raised that currently the Government / community projects like the bicycle parking proposal was hindered by minority, and that the interest of the majority was neglected. The two Rural Committees, the Island District Council and local villagers would like to have more developments on Lamma. It would not be fair to let the majority bounded by the minority. Local villagers should be given priority in the Government considerations as others (expatriates) were only passing population. The Rural Committee would be happy to help collecting public views on the development proposals. The Government was urged to implement the project as planned.

20 February, 2013

Appendix 9:

Gist of Major Comments from the Focus Group Meeting with Green Groups, Professional Institutes and Concerned Parties

Planning and Engineering Study on Future Land Use at Ex-Lamma Quarry Area at Sok Kwu Wan, Lamma Island – Feasibility Study

Quick Gist on the Focus Group Meeting on 6 February 2013 at City Gallery, Central

1. Number of participants

A total of 18 people participated in the Focus Group Meeting (FGM). Representatives from professional institutes (HKIS, HKIP, HKIUD and HKILA), green groups (Association for Geoconservation Hong Kong, Living Lamma, South Lamma Concern Group and LINC) and local NGOs (Mo Tat Community, St. James' Settlement, Lamma-zine, YMCA of Hong Kong).

2. Issues Discussed

2.1 Development Themes

Housing

HKIP considered that there were not much difference between three land use options and considered that the housing options would not be viable. The proposed housing theme would neither provide luxury houses or affordable housing for lower income class to meet the need of Hong Kong.

HKIS agreed that housing would not be viable at the site since rich people will not live there and there were also no job opportunities for general public. The population threshold would not be able to provide community facilities like school or hospital. He opined that the provision of subsidized housing at the site as proposed by the CE would contradict with the original development theme/intention of the site for conservation.

Alternatives to Housing

HKIP considered that the proposed housing development would not be able to meet the territorial housing demand of Hong Kong and suggested the study should look into other land use options.

Living Lamma reminded that in the consultations in 2011 and 2012, green groups were told that options other than housing would be considered in the study. They did not understand why housing suddenly became a prerequisite for land use options in the study. Other options like sports and recreation, tourism and eco-education should be considered.

Development Should Adhere to Planning Intention of Lamma

Living Lamma did not see the how the proposed land use options could fulfill the planning intention of Lamma Island as stated in the Outline Zoning Plan, which was to preserve the natural environment and cultural heritage, and to provide leisure and tourism destination. They considered that the proposed development were out of the environmental context of Lamma and would not be compatible with the rural character of Lamma. They were worried that the proposed development would only be compatible with and make way for the “Baroque on Lamma” development proposed by others.

Living Lamma suggested that the planning intention to create a car-free community was visionary, there future development should build on this advantage of Lamma to provide a walkable community.

Tourism, Eco-education and Leisure Uses

Living Lamma proposed that the concept of Eden Project in UK should be considered, that was to have a world class theme park providing leisure and education facilities. They suggested that the current holiday camp operation of YMCA should be maintained, and other ecological and environmental education elements could be provided in the park to bring people out of city and experience the environment. This could generate job opportunities, serve as a showcase of sustainable living, and fulfill the planning intention of Lamma.

HKIP suggested that tourism might be a sustainable use at the site since the traffic pattern would be different from the commuter traffic of residential development. Unlike commuter traffic which would require a lot of trips during rush hours, uses like holiday camp would have less traffic impact.

HKIP noted that the study team mentioned the synergy with the Ocean Park in the presentation, however, there were no linkages between the land use proposals and the Ocean Park.

HKIUD reminded that Atkins had carried out a tourism study for Planning Department in 2000 and it suggested that the whole site could be developed for tourism use. They suggested that this would create job opportunities in Lamma.

Geological Education

Association for Geoconservation Hong Kong (AGHK) agreed that the ex-quarry site should be developed into tourist attraction with quarry as a heritage. Quarry museum and history of quarry mining could be displayed, with Lamma Suite, a unique type of Granite, could be an attraction showcasing the unique geological feature of the site.

Other Themes

HKIP suggested that entertainment uses such as water sports, research and educational institutes, and uses related to marine and fishing culture should be considered.

HKIP suggested that the site could accommodate/ relocate some other Government and community currently located in urban area, so it might be able to release other sites in urban area for other developments.

2.2 Facilities and Land Use

Museum of Quarrying

AGHK suggested that a quarry museum could be provided to showcase the quarry history of Hong Kong and *Lamma Suite*, the unique granite found on Lamma Island.

Hotel and Water Sports Centre

HKIS worried if the operation of the proposed hotel and water sports centre would be viable since there might not be enough professional staff to operate those uses.

Marina

HKIS worried that marina was unrealistic and would not be viable at the site. They suggested that marina worked in Aberdeen because people could berth the vessels at the marina and access to other locations, while people could not access to other destinations after their vessels were berthed at the marina at the site.

YMCA reminded that the water channel outside Lamma Island was very busy and frequently used by large vessels. They were worried that the provision of marina at the site might lead to more marine accidents.

Holiday Camp

YMCA suggested that currently they were providing recreation facilities at the site and getting people from the city. They also engaged the local community on transportation and that created economic opportunities. They hoped that these activities could be continued in future.

Design to Resist Typhoon

YMCA pointed out that unlike the village in Sok Kwu Wan which was situated in strategic location, the study site was very vulnerable to typhoon as experienced in the Typhoon No. 10 last year. Proper design measures should be adopted.

2.3 Ecological and Geological Conservation

Protection of Natural Shoreline

AGHK and LINC considered that natural shorelines are very valuable in Hong Kong, and suggested that the natural shoreline at the study site and the coastal protection area in its surroundings should not be disturbed to protect marine ecology. LINC requested the panel to promise that the natural shoreline would not be disturbed.

AGHK also worried that the natural shoreline at the CDA site next to the study site would be destroyed. They were of the concern that the proposed walkway from the study site to Lo So Shing would affect the natural shoreline.

Concerns on Ecologic Impact of Proposed Development

LINC did not agree on the conclusion that the ecologic value of southern Lamma was low. They were discontented that no mitigation measures to the ecological impacts of the proposed development were proposed. They requested the consultants to look into the impacts of the proposed development, such as marine impact, light impact, etc. to marine mammals, amphibians, corals, and the fish culture activities in Sok Kwo Wan.

HKILA stressed that the ecological value of the study site should be determined by AFCD, but not the consultant, and reminded that the comments from AFCD on the ecological impact would be important.

YMCA reminded that there were some species found in the lake and on the maintain and worried that they would be gone once there were development.

2.4 Concern of Infrastructure Provision

HKIS was concerned on the traffic impact due to the increase of population.

LINC worried that the ferry routes proposed by the consultant might not be accepted by the ferry operators and Transport Department, since these might not be viable due to low patronage. LINC criticized that no representatives from Transport Department at the FGM to answer these questions.

St. James' Settlement also worried that the increase in population would increase the burden on the transportation.

2.5 Concern of Social Impact

St. James' Settlement worried that the increase in population might change the living style of the locals.

LINC and Mo Tat Community complained that the police services at Sok Kwu Wan were poor and worried that the security would be worsened after the proposed development was in place.

2.6 Comment on the Study Process

The Need for Strategic Planning Decision

HKIP opined that this study should have looked into the strategic planning context rather than drawing layout plans, since strategic planning decision should be policy driven and layout plan could not be formulated out of vacuum. They suggested that the study go back to basics by identifying what Hong Kong needed most, and the study should review the constraints and potentials of the site and evaluating what future uses would be sustainable and viable. In order to ensure that the proposed land uses would be viable, studies on critical mass, business case and urban economics would be required.

HKIUD echoed that the study did not look into what people in Lamma really needed and it failed to demonstrate the strategies and policies that would implement the proposals in the layout plans. HKIS suggested that a market survey would be required to decide on the position of Lamma.

Lack of Stakeholders' Consensus on Vision Statement

HKIUD questioned how the vision statement of the land use option was formulated and opined that the current vision failed to encompass the views from all stakeholders, as a result, everyone was not on the same page.

HKIUD criticized that the vision was formulated in a small group but not developed with the community, and therefore the land use proposals failed to respond to local aspirations discussed in the FGM.

Proposed Land Use Options unable to meet the Guiding Principles

HKIUD suggested that they could not see how the land use options respond to the guiding principles developed by the study team since they were unable to meet the aspirations of local stakeholders.

No Study on the Development Context of Lamma

There was discontent from Living Lamma on the lack of studies on the development context of the overall Lamma when formulating the proposed land uses. They considered that the study did not look into other developments on Lamma, such as the abandoned empty houses on Lamma (Lamma 1 of King Wong), land banking of property developers, the proposed development in southern Lamma and huge development pressure on Lamma. They considered that the community could not make informed decisions if information on the development context and the bigger picture were missing. HKIP concurred with the views from Living Lamma that the study lacked the context and bigger picture.

HKIS and Living Lamma urged the government to do research on how many people would live in Lamma given there were no job opportunity and long journey time to urban areas.

Landscape and Visual Assessment

HKILA requested that a landscape and visual impact assessment should be conducted to understand the overall landscape and visual character of the site, which should be presented to the public. HKIS also considered that the natural landscape and resources of the site should be preserved.

Next Stage of the Study

Living Lamma worried that the study would go into the next stage and comments received in this stage would not be able to make a difference. They questioned if other new alternative land use proposals would be accepted in next stage.

2.7 Comment on Public Engagement Process

Wrong Messages to the Public in Previous Public Engagement Activities

LINC suggested that the consultants had promised to the local community that they could provide school and medical services if the proposed development were allowed. LINC were discontented that the consultants denied at the FGM that they made such promise in the previous public engagement event.

Information Exchange

LINC suggested the government to upload the presentation materials on the ecological findings to the website so that these could be reviewed by international observers.

LINC criticized that the study team failed to provide technical information since 2011 and nobody answered the question on the distance between the site and SSSI.

HKIP expressed that although the public engagement period would be over after the FGM, they still would like to provide comments to the study team and requested the government to continue to listen to comments from the community.

Living Lamma invited the consultant team to visit Lamma with them together to understand the existing problems faced by locals, including the lacking of destinations for tourism and environmental education at Yung Shue Wan, and the lacking of proper maintenance of archaeological sites, and rubbish at beaches and streams.

Poor Timing of Public Engagement

LINC and Living Lamma criticized that the timing of public engagement period was poor since it was between two major holidays.

7 February 2013

Appendix 10:

Gist of Major Comments from the Focus Group Meeting with Tourism and Hotel Industry

Planning and Engineering Study on Future Land Use at Ex-Lamma Quarry Area at Sok Kwu Wan, Lamma Island – Feasibility Study

Quick Gist on the Meeting Tourism Sector on 4 March, 2013 at CEDD Conference Room, North Point Government Offices

1. Participants

Mr. Mason Hung, Hong Kong Tourism Board
Mr. Paul Leung, Hong Kong Tourism Board
Ms Anna Cheung, Hong Kong Tourism Board
Mr. Daniel Ng, Hong Kong Ecotourism Society

2. Issues Discussed

2.1 Demand for Hotel

In view of overnight visitors to Hong Kong having a double-digit growth, Mr. Leung considered that the provision of hotel rooms would meet the demand for different visitors.

2.2 Positioning of the Hotel

Mr. Hung pointed out that a study on spa resort was conducted 7-8 years ago and the findings might no longer be applicable. In the consideration of resort hotels in Hong Kong, spa hotels would not have competitive edge as compared with those in SE Asian countries and sports resort would be out of the question. There might be attraction in higher end hotel themed on health resort applied with Chinese herbal medicine.

Ms. Cheung said that tourists from Mainland did not like Tai O Fishing Village because there were plenty in Mainland, the Euro-American visitors might consider the location being too close to the modern high rise developments in Ap Lei Chau, but young achievers would be a possible customer source.

As the hotel would be located close to CBD with about 30minutes commuting time, the possibility of providing good low rise environment for the business travelers was discussed. Mr. Leung said that whichever sector of the hotel would have customers.

Possibility on the hotel provision for family segment was also discussed. Mr. Leung pointed out that large indoor area of 10,000 to 15,000 sq. ft. would be required for various activities, like rope climbing, etc. Inter-connected rooms would make the hotel operation more flexible. Reference could be made to the large scale hot spring resort in Japan. Mr. Hung also suggested making reference to Club Med where the family could eat, play with somebody to baby-sit.

2.3 Scale of the Hotel

Mr. Leung said that a small hotel of say, 60 rooms, would have difficulty to survive and considered that a high end hotel of 5 star or 6 star would be more commercially viable.

2.4 Transport and Accessibility

Mr. Hung pointed out that transportation was a critical consideration for hotels on outlying islands. Typhoon was another consideration.

The operation of the ferry services via Sok Kwu Wan and ELQ was discussed. There was concern if the ferry could manoeuvre between the 2 piers within such short distance in the bay, with the constraints of the fish culture zone.

It would be good to have a dedicated pier/ landing steps for the hotel both at the development site and in-town, like Aberdeen or Ap Lei Chau.

2.5 Hotel Facilities

As a resort hotel, it was important to provide adequate facilities within the hotel. Seclusion was important. Reference could be made to Banyan Tree in Bangkok.

Man-made Lake

The lake was not important to be part of the hotel facility. However, should the hotel be required to manage the lake, the investors/ operators might have reservation on the cost and liability.

2.6 Sustainable Tourism

The concept of sustainable tourism was discussed. It was required to conserve the local character of Sok Kwu Wan.

Mr. Ng pointed out that many people considered that the fishing village / fish culture was an important character. The existing Lamma Fish Culture Village was an attraction. The quarry was also a characteristics but the hotel development would block it away.

He said that guided eco-tourism was also quite popular in Lamma. His customers included local HK people, overseas visitors as well as 'younger' tourists from Mainland. Their interest included the plants, rocks, culture, environmental change, changes to the villages, fishing village and practices. It would be good that these visitors would stay for one or two nights in Lamma.

He was concerned that the resort hotel would need a lot of supporting facilities and therefore worried that it would have knock-on effects on the environment and the fish culture. He also considered that the sea food street was also an important character and disagreed with Mr. Leung that the sea food restaurants could be operated within the hotel. He suggested that the hotel should not be too high end. The facilities around the area should not be unnecessary excessive to retain the existing character.

Mr. Leung commented that a hotel themed on rock quarry would have fewer disturbances on the environment, and it was possible for the hotel to integrate with the hill and natural environment, with a symbiosis development mode.

Mr. Hung advised that high end hotels overseas would pay a lot of emphasis on sustainable tourism development. They would use local construction materials, consume local produce, and provide local employment, and conserving local culture. On the contrary, low-end hotels would achieve much less in this aspect.

2.7 Adjoining Uses

Suggestions included:

- The man-made shoreline be reconstructed as a man-made rock beach
- The proposed pier be designed extending further and form a long bridge into the bay, like that in Norwich Cove, to increase attractiveness in itself
- Housing and other development might have impact on the hotel, and therefore needed to be separated and visually buffered.
- Should there be different hotels (high/ low end), visual buffers would be required.
- The presence of the sewage treatment plant adjoining the hotel was not considered a nuisance, but it could be used for education (with grey water reuse for irrigation) and become an attraction in itself. Reference could be made to Huis Ten Bosch in Japan.

2.8 Further Consultation

It was suggested that Tourism Industry Council (Mr. Joseph Tung, Executive Director) and The Federation of Hong Kong Hotel Owners Limited (Mr. Michael Li) should be further consulted on the attractiveness of the resort hotel to the hotel business.

It was noted that the HKTA's overseas officers would have a meeting in Hong Kong in June and it would be good to seek their advice on the marketability of the resort hotel then.

5 March 2013

Appendix 11: Gist of Major Comments from the Community Workshop

Planning and Engineering Study on Future Land Use at Ex-Lamma Quarry Area at Sok Kwu Wan, Lamma Island – Feasibility Study

Quick Gist on the Community Workshop on 5 January, 2013

1. Number of participants

A total of about 80 people participated in the Community Workshop, about 64 of them joined in the group discussion.

There was a total of 8 discussion groups, 5 of them were conducted in Cantonese and 3 discussion groups were conducted in English.

2. Issues Discussed

2.1 Theme for Future Development

Most participants did not indicate their preference for the option, but they discussed on the components of the various theme. Only one group specifically mentioned that they liked Option 1A but with tourism / hotel use.

A number of groups mentioned that the site should be developed into an environmentally friendly community and should respect the local fishing culture.

Majority of the groups agreed to housing provision at the Study Site but they would like to have affordable housing. Some mentioned that the housing provision should cater for the needs of the local people, including the villagers and fishermen, instead of attracting outsiders to live on the Island.

Some groups agreed to have hotel development at the Study Site. Some agreed to tourism development, but they opined that tourism development might not be equal to hotel. Instead, some advocated for holiday camp type development, with eco-tourism components, which could be affordable by all. Educational element was raised by many.

2.2 Population and Development Intensity

Some groups supported that the Study Site should be exploited to accommodate more population. About 2 groups considered that a population of 5,000 to 7,000 would be appropriate.

Some others considered that the Study Site should only provide affordable housing to meet the needs of the local people. A group did not comment on the

population threshold, but considered that 3-storeyed development would be more appropriate. One group suggested phased development and organic growth.

There were also 2 groups who did not want to have any population at the Study Site.

2.3 Facilities and Land Use

Marina

All the groups did not support marina development, either because they would not be used by the general public, or because they would have conflict with the local culture/ fish culture in Sok Kwu Wan.

Man-made Lake

All the groups mentioned that the lake was a unique feature that should be protected. Most groups suggested that the lake should be preserved in total. There were, however, some groups who considered that the lake could be reduced in size but with enhancement measures. While many groups considered that the lake should be provided with water sports, some others proposed that it should be for amenity purpose only.

Hotel

Two groups agreed with hotel development, some others advocated that holiday camp type development, with eco-education/ eco-tourism components and training facilities would be more appropriate. Facilities like rock-climbing, and other adventure, etc could be incorporated

Water Sports Centre

The water sports centre was supported by a few but some considered that the lake was too small for water sports.

Others

Some proposed that the developments at the Study Site should be equipped with environmentally friendly measure, use renewable energy, recycling facilities and low-carbon.

Many proposed that community facilities should be provided to meet the needs of the residents. The facilities included: clinic, fire station and library, etc.

A few groups made reference to Eden Project in London and considered that such concepts should be incorporated in the Study Site. (<http://www.edenproject.com/>)

2.4 External Connection

All the groups agreed that a new pier be built for the ferry services which should be connected to Central and Aberdeen. A few groups suggested that the ferry should be connected to Ap Lei Chau, so that quick connection to MTR could be made.

All the groups agreed that there should be improved access from the Study Site to Lo So Shing. They considered that such road connection would be required even if there would be some reclamation. Some mentioned that the road should be carefully studied to minimize reclamation; some mentioned that it should not be concrete road to minimize disruption to the environment. A group suggested that the road should also accommodate emergency vehicles.

5 Jan 2013

Appendix 12:

Gist of Major Comments from the Community Forum

Planning and Engineering Study on Future Land Use at Ex-Lamma Quarry Area at Sok Kwu Wan, Lamma Island – Feasibility Study

Quick Gist on the Community Forum at Yung Shue Wan on 12 January, 2013

1. Number of participants

A total of about 80 people participated in the Community Workshop.

2. Issues Discussed

2.1 Guiding Principles

A number of participants expressed their concern on how the guiding principles were established; and how the study proposals could meet the guiding principle of sustainable development. There were concerns on:

- The social impact of population increase and intensified development on local social environment;
- carrying capacity of Lamma in terms of infrastructure and ecological character;
- the natural ecology should be protected;
- the proposals have no relationship with the fishing village/ culture in Sok Kwu Wan,
- the new development will kill the old/ existing ones;
- local character of small shops, family-run business; with no chain store like 7-11; welcome or park-n-shop should be preserved;
- how the study would help small local business to develop;
- The proposals were not socially or environmental sustainable;
- Social Impact Assessment, not only for Sok Kwu Wan, but also for the whole of Lamma was required.

There were also worries that the proposed development at ELQ was only the beginning of further and much more intensive development on Lamma, and set precedent for high rise / more intensive development like the one proposed at Mo Tat Wan.

2.2 Baseline Information

There were dissatisfaction about the lack of technical and baseline information for the study. Quite a number of participants questioned whether ecological survey

and other studies on the baseline conditions were carried out. They would like to see the reports for these studies.

Some considered that the Study Site was not idle land, but an area with rich ecology. Some others pointed out that the Study Site was excavated for quarry development, the plantation grew slow and the ecology was not rich.

2.3 Theme for Future Development

Some participants commented that they did not like to be given the three options and asked to revert to the beginning with a ‘white board’. Some suggested having a “No-development” option.

Housing

There was concern on why all the options had housing development. Some people suggested that there should not be any housing at the Study Site. Other concerns include:

- proof of housing demand was requested;
- housing demand in Hong Kong was not houses with boats;
- there was concern that Sok Kwu Wan would become another Discovery Bay;

There was another request for more intensive development in the Study Site, and should learn from the failure of Sea Ranch and Mui Wo where the development scale was inadequate;

Tourism

There was concern on the form of tourism proposed.

- While one considered that the eco-education centre was only ‘green wash’; some others considered that eco-education should be the theme for the Study Site;
- the tourist did not come to see buildings, but they wanted to see the greenery / scenery;
- Sok Kwu Wan should be used for community park

2.4 Population and Development Intensity

There were concerns on:

- increasing existing population by 330%;
- high rise (up to 12 storeys) vs. existing 3 storeys building;

- housing for local people vs. outsiders / wealthy people;

2.3 Facilities and Land Use

Marina

Many participants considered that marina was not compatible with the local living setting and one participant also pointed out that the local fishermen also expressed worries on the adverse impact of the marina on the fish culture.

Others:

Other suggestions include:

- Community Park
- The community needed doctors and school
- Outreach Centre for children and for disabled children

2.4 External Connection

Some expressed that the solution for improving ferry services to Sok Kwu Wan was not by 'dumping' more people in the Study Site. Transport policy was required for the provision.

2.5 Implementation

There were concern on who would fund the development, the cost for the infrastructure, and its cost-effectiveness.

2.6 Public Engagement

A few participants complained about the public engagement programme which took place at a season when they 'wind down' for holidays and Christmas. They had lost a month to discuss on the issue and asked more extension of another month.

There was request that the Study Team should discuss with the green groups and the local village people (not the Rural Committee) individually.

There was also enquiry on whether there would be another option in the Stage 2 public consultation and whether additional public consultation could be carried out.

13 Jan 2013

Appendix 13:

Gist of Major Comments from the Public Forum

Planning and Engineering Study on Future Land Use at Ex-Lamma Quarry Area at Sok Kwu Wan, Lamma Island – Feasibility Study

Quick Gist on the Public Forum on 19 January, 2013 at City Gallery, Central

1. Number of participants

A total of about 80 people participated in the Public Forum. They came from different backgrounds, including Lamma villagers, Lamma residents, non-Lamma residents and visitors, and also from Hong Kong Institute of Urban Design (HKIUD) and Association of Engineers in Society (AES).

2. Issues Discussed

2.1 Development Themes

There were advocacy for sustainable development with eco-tourism, suitable amount of hotel and housing development. The future development should not depart from the functions of Lamma as the back garden of Hong Kong.

Housing

Quite a number of participants (including local villagers and non-Lamma residents) supported Option 1A. They hoped that with the increase in population, the facilities in the area could be enhanced and this would bring convenience to the local people. Low density development (with less than 5,000 population) would enable co-existence of with environment and development.

The housing problem was very serious and therefore it was necessary to fully utilize the land. The Chairman of Lamma South Rural Committee pointed out that Lamma South needed more population to facilitate the provision of better facilities and better transport. He said that the residents of Lamma fully support the plan. There were also participants who echoed with the current deficiency on people, transport, economy and medical facilities.

Hong Kong Institute of Urban Design (HKIUD) considered that the population was not large enough to bring the necessary community facilities such as school to all of Lamma. Some participants, including Association of Engineers in Society (AES) also opined that there was inadequate land in Hong Kong and with the increase in population, there was need to develop more land for housing. AES further suggested that the site could be used for housing; or relocating other Government facilities in the urban area to this site, so as to free up other urban sites for housing uses.

Many participants considered that the housing should not be for the privileged few and there were support for subsidized housing (HOS), and that it should give priority to the local residents.

Green Sense proposed to build HOS which would allow pets to make it unique in character.

However, there were also objection to housing development and the need for housing development in Sok Kwu Wan.

Some challenged that the housing demand in Hong Kong was due to the mismatch of resources and failure of housing policy which led to houses with no occupants and people have no place to live.

All three options were proposed without prior consultation. All with luxurious housing and marina, and this would not solve the housing and community needs.

There were concerns why there was no “no-housing” option. There might be urgent need for housing in Hong Kong, but this was not the only urgent need, there were also needs for fresh air, recreational space, etc. All three options with their supporting public infrastructure, transport facilities would be irreversible impacts on the ecology, environment and fish culture.

There was doubts on the provision of small number of flats on Lamma would, in any ways, not solve the housing problem in Hong Kong and therefore housing could be accommodated some other places and better use this site for other uses like sustainable living park.

Although it was agreeable that housing should be provided for the lower income group, but how to address the traveling cost for these people.

Tourism

Both community and tourism facilities should be enhanced to increase the attractiveness of Lamma and Hong Kong as a whole, and to increase local employment.

There were queries on why the preferred land use in 1995 as recreational was changed and how the housing development would attract tourists. The site should be used as recreational resource / nature reserve/ educational facility.

There was suggestion to create a sustainable lifecycle park to support sustainable development in Hong Kong. Projects like “Project Eden” in UK would benefit local people and attract overseas tourists.

There was concern on the irreversible impact of hotel development on ecology, environment and fish culture.

2.2 Sensitive Design

There was concern that PlanD and CEDD did not have sensitive design be compatible with the environment to the planning in Sok Kwu Wan. HKIUD considered that all options did not adequately respond to the opportunities of developing the site, being based on outdated and standardized planning principles. Given the bad track record in the proposed reclamation in Yung Shue Wan, there were worries on the lack of sensitive design responding to community needs of this area.

Any development should be done in a sensitive manner using a sustainable and place-making approach to result in a win-win situation for all.

The current three proposals resembled the development in Discovery Bay but this was against the local natural and rural characteristics which should be respected. Tourists came to Lamma but not Discovery Bay. Any development proposals should respect the character of Lamma which was only 3 stories in height, and Sustainable Development.

2.3 Ecological Study and Holistic Planning for Lamma

Some participants considered that 6-months ecological study inadequate. There were a lot of wildlife and ecological interests on various parts of Lamma, such as the green turtles in Sham Wan, Romer's Tree Frog, etc, and they (including Eco-education and Resources Centre) urged for ecological study should be carried out for the whole of Lamma. Designing Hong Kong and some others also considered that holistic planning for the whole Island should be carried out.

2.4 Lack of Information for the Public

There was discontent from Living Lamma on the lack of information to the public which did not include other developments, housing demand, ecology or environmental problems that Lamma was facing. There was concern that the views of the green groups were ignored in the study. It was also raised that the consultation took place in the absence of real evidence. The reports available to the public were not relevant and inadequate.

2.5 Facilities and Land Use

Marina

There was objection to the marina which would cause adverse impact to the fish culture in the Bay. One raised that with the provision of Lakeside Park and marina, what would be the mitigation measures to avoid conflict with the local

culture/ fish culture in Sok Kwu Wan and to protect and minimize impact on the ecology.

Man-made Lake

Some participants suggested that should be protected with enhanced leisure facilities.

Hotel

While there was support for hotel development, there was concern on its impact on ecology, environment and fish culture.

G/IC uses

There were request on the provision of G/IC land and educational facilities. With the increase of population on Lamma, the Government should provided adequate G/IC uses; otherwise, there would be community and social problems.

Many proposed that community facilities should be provided to meet the needs of the residents. The facilities included: clinic, fire station, market, school, and police post, etc. There was concern if the fire-boat/ fire station would adequately serve the tall building, therefore the building height should be reduced.

2.6 External Connection

There was suggestion that the ferry should be connected to Mo Tat Wan and Sok Kwu Wan.

Some participants agreed that there should be improved access along the beach from the Study Site to Lo So Shing and Sok Kwu Wan.

2.7 Implementation

The Chairman of Lamma South Rural Committee urged for early implementation of housing development. The housing problem was very serious and therefore it was necessary to fully utilize the land.

There was concern on the cost of infrastructure and the impacts of the development on the environment including air and marine pollution. Designing Hong Kong was also concerned about the implications on sewerage treatment, fire services, water supply and slope.

A number of participants raised concern on the public private partnership and who would be the developer. Since the Policy Address had already mentioned the PPP, it showed that the consultation was already pre-empted with no meaning. The PPP would not in the interests of the local people. All the facilities like clubhouse, lake would be restricted for free access by others. The residents who had their clubhouse would not dine in the local seafood stalls. Green Sense was concerned

that the development programme and the price level might not be controllable by the Government.

There was proposal that the development sites should be tendered openly to avoid from monopoly.

2.8 Scope of Finalization Stage

Living Lamma was concern that this study and the public consultation was a foregone process. It was questioned on the scope of finalization stage and whether any sufficient changes to the three options could be made to meet the aspirations and concerns of the commenters.

2.9 Others

There was concern on Government's resource allocation system which was based on the number of population, and disregarding the number of tourists. Lamma needed more community facilities. However, once more residents were added in, the scenery would be destroyed.

More green groups and environmental people should be consulted.

20 January, 2013

Appendix 14: List of Commenters

No.	Name	Organization/ Individual
001	Ms. Leung	Individual
002	嚴先生	Individual
003	嚴先生	Individual
004	周小姐	Individual
005	Kennex	Individual
006	陳明新	Individual
007	黎慧芬	Resident
008	Li Kim Hung	Individual
009	Chan Yuk Liz	Individual
010	溫榮	Sok Kwu Wan Resident
011	張佩芳	Individual
012	李劍明	Individual
013	文志新	Individual
014	歐錦明	Individual
015	陳名輝	Individual
016	張文成	Individual
017	梁佩芝	Individual
018	朱榮私	Individual
019	Unidentified	Individual
020	Yuen Kwok Wing	Individual
021	Wong Chi Keung	Individual
022	Chung Wai Ling	Individual
023	Wgan Sai Lun	Individual
024	劉少平	Individual
025	吳九仔	Individual
026	林有福	Individual
027	彭亞根	Individual
028	To Pui Yee	Individual
029	Unidentified	Individual
030	Lee Moon Tong	Individual
031	Chan SO	Individual
032	黃牛仔	Individual
033	蔡少比	Individual
034	張俊賢	Individual
035	胡蝶兒	Individual
036	Cheong Chun Sing	Individual
037	Tammy Chan	Individual
038	葉寶員	Sok Kwu Wan Resident
039	黎玉蘭	Sok Kwu Wan Resident
040	李寶榮	Sok Kwu Wan Resident
041	王桂芳	Sok Kwu Wan Shop Owner
042	Julie Chan	Sok Kwu Wan Shop Owner

No.	Name	Organization/ Individual
043	Ling Tse Kit Kevin	Resident
044	馮啟子	Individual
045	Unidentified	Individual
046	黃志雄	Individual
047	吳惠芬	Sok Kwu Wan Resident
048	楊錦霞	Sok Kwu Wan Shop Owner
049	楊美珍	Individual
050	楊貴珍	Individual
051	張西門	Sok Kwu Wan Resident
052	黎世明	Individual
053	周蘊玉	Individual
054	李少昱	Resident
055	Unidentified	Individual
056	陳玉瑩	Individual
057	周少英	Individual
058	李惠敏	Individual
059	Lai Pui Wai	Sok Kwu Wan Resident
060	Lai Pui King	Individual
061	賴韻晴	Individual
062	Violet	Sok Kwu Wan Shop Owner
063	鄭永昌	Individual
064	鄭耀南	Sok Kwu Wan Shop Owner
065	Lee Chin Ping	Sok Kwu Wan Resident
066	Cheng Wing Hong	Individual
067	胡嘉敏	Individual
068	石世邦	Individual
069	Kenneth Wu	Individual
070	胡國正	Sok Kwu Wan Resident
071	胡美珍	Individual
072	胡秀珍	Individual
073	Unidentified	Indigenous Inhabitant
074	胡錦珍	Individual
075	譚社瑜	Individual
076	Unidentified	Sok Kwu Wan Resident
077	嚴蓮	Sok Kwu Wan Resident
078	梁英才	Sok Kwu Wan Resident
079	何惠玲	Individual
080	周嘉軒	Individual
081	蔡連英	Individual
082	達	Individual
083	Joyce Yuen	Individual
084	梁淑蓮	Individual

No.	Name	Organization/ Individual
085	袁華廣	Individual
086	陳嘉欣	Individual
087	馮金	Individual
088	黃玉芬	Individual
089	黃湛明	Individual
090	夏倩儀	Individual
091	夏夢華	Individual
092	楊華輝	Individual
093	黃志華	Individual
094	蘇金成	Individual
095	吳偉鵬	Individual
096	張亞來	Individual
097	黃佛有	Individual
098	黃帶好	Individual
099	黃嘉敏	Individual
100	黃志偉	Individual
101	邱均明	Individual
102	楊金妹	Individual
103	吳淑儀	Individual
104	吳惠妍	Individual
105	陳鳳儀	Individual
106	黃秀連	Individual
107	黃庭芳	Individual
108	鄭嘉俊	Individual
109	鄭得勝	Individual
110	鄭家輝	Individual
111	徐震宇	Individual
112	鄭家碧	Individual
113	Unidentified	Individual
114	謝妙梅	Southern District Resident
115	張敬忠	Individual
116	陳翠霞	Southern District Resident
117	朱萬華	Southern District Resident
118	姚莠汶	Individual
119	Ho Kwok Fu	Individual
120	Chan Yuen Kei Carmen	Individual
121	黃貴蓮	Individual
122	倫佩玲	Southern District Resident
123	李慧儀	Southern District Resident
124	梁志偉	Southern District Resident
125	馮淑鳳	Southern District Resident

No.	Name	Organization/ Individual
126	郭秀清	Southern District Resident
127	張珮琪	Southern District Resident
128	Unidentified	Southern District Resident
129	李秀芬	Southern District Resident
130	劉添	Southern District Resident
131	劉卓倫	Individual
132	蔡麗霞	Individual
133	Lau Wai Kee	Individual
134	Cheung Kong Fai	Individual
135	Unidentified	Individual
136	陳霞	Individual
137	徐惠姚	Individual
138	黃艷仙	Individual
139	張少玲	Individual
140	Unidentified	Individual
141	Unidentified	Individual
142	吳志鳳	Individual
143	梁帶福	Individual
144	Unidentified	Southern District Resident
145	黎敏明	Individual
146	梁耀榮	Southern District Resident
147	鄭志全	Fisherman
148	黎金彤	Individual
149	鄭志成	Individual
150	蘇玉英	Individual
151	蘇玉英	Individual
152	鄭志威	Individual
153	鄭金水	Fisherman
154	鄭木金	Fisherman
155	鄭志成	Fisherman
156	梁亞福	Individual
157	梁亞坤	Individual
158	梁伙勝	Individual
159	梁明遠	Southern District Resident
160	Lee Kai Shing	Southern District Resident
161	吳力光	Southern District Resident
162	Rita Chow	Southern District Resident
163	Eva Mok	Southern District Resident
164	鄭疊開	Southern District Resident
165	鍾月群	Southern District Resident
166	Unidentified	Southern District Resident
167	黎少琼	Southern District Resident

No.	Name	Organization/ Individual
168	曾雪英	Southern District Resident
169	鍾麗明	Southern District Resident
170	黃劍明	Southern District Resident
171	顏白璇	Southern District Resident
172	Chan Clarence	Southern District Resident
173	Ching Siu Wai	Southern District Resident
174	高錦永	Southern District Resident
175	Unidentified	Southern District Resident
176	Alice Ng	Southern District Resident
177	潘智華	Southern District Resident
178	Ng Wing Keen	Southern District Resident
179	Unidentified	Southern District Resident
180	楊少麗	Southern District Resident
181	伍佩雪	Southern District Resident
182	梁綺霞	Southern District Resident
183	易立嫻	Southern District Resident
184	李茗	Southern District Resident
185	Wong Lai Fan	Southern District Resident
186	羅焯量	Southern District Resident
187	蔡潤娣	Mo Tat Wan Indigenous Inhabitant
188	周志富	Yung Shue Ha Indigenous Inhabitant
189	鄭惠華	Yung Shue Ha Indigenous Inhabitant
190	周樹棠	Yung Shue Ha Indigenous Inhabitant
191	周雪茵	Lamma Island (South) Indigenous Inhabitant
192	周志忠	Lamma Island (South) Indigenous Inhabitant
193	黃申蘭	Yung Shue Ha Indigenous Inhabitant
194	Mandy	Yung Shue Ha Indigenous Inhabitant
195	Kwok Chi Keung	Individual
196	周冠娣	Mo Tat Wan Indigenous Inhabitant
197	陳英嬌	Yung Shue Ha Indigenous Inhabitant
198	吳亞金	Lamma Island (South) Indigenous Inhabitant
199	周土明	Yung Shue Ha Indigenous Inhabitant
200	劉漢華	Individual
201	周傑凌	Tung O Indigenous Inhabitant
202	沈惠卿	Indigenous Inhabitant
203	姚國浩	Indigenous Inhabitant
204	沈麗萍	Indigenous Inhabitant
205	姚雪瑩	Indigenous Inhabitant
206	姚雲興	Indigenous Inhabitant
207	姚健業	Indigenous Inhabitant
208	姚健聰	Indigenous Inhabitant
209	周炳鳳	Indigenous Inhabitant

No.	Name	Organization/ Individual
210	Yiu Yau Choi 姚有財	Indigenous Inhabitant
211	Li Kin Keung	Individual
212	Tsang Hing Hong	Individual
213	羅振洋	Individual
214	Paul Lam	Individual
215	George Lo	Individual
216	Jennifer Lau	Individual
217	Wong Yuk Man	Individual
218	Lo Hung Cheuk	Individual
219	Lo Kam Wing	Individual
220	何焯成	Individual
221	林博而	Individual
222	李思樂	Individual
223	文熾濠	Individual
224	李寶基	Individual
225	楊國耀	Individual
226	鄭子達	Individual
227	李天春	Individual
228	翟念初	Individual
229	蘇海祥	Individual
230	黃富榮	Individual
231	劉玉梅	Individual
232	蘇志強	Individual
233	孔嘉華	Individual
234	蘇海龍	Individual
235	蘇國新	Individual
236	蘇何當	Individual
237	郭見明	Sok Kwu Wan Resident
238	Unidentified	Individual
239	劉宏喜	Individual
240	梁靜嫻	Southern District Resident
241	Unidentified	Southern District Resident
242	陳嘉儀	Southern District Resident
243	招秀珍	Individual
244	陳有和	Individual
245	吳世福	Southern District Resident
246	張辛嫻	Southern District Resident
247	Kwan Lai Ying	Southern District Resident
248	Kwan Chun Wa	Southern District Resident
249	Kwan Lai Yan	Southern District Resident
250	劉霞	Individual
251	姚雲貴	Southern District Resident

No.	Name	Organization/ Individual
252	蘇婉芳	Southern District Resident
253	黎金娣	Southern District Resident
254	梁琇妹	Individual
255	馮十五妹	Fisherman
256	鄭帶勝	Representative of Sok Kwu Wan Fisherman
257	鄭志輝	Fisherman
258	鄭木水	Fisherman
259	黎蘇妹	Fisherman
260	鄭華勝	Individual
261	鄭進傑	Individual
262	鄭金成	Individual
263	鄭金有	Individual
264	鄭志文	Individual
265	鄭九	Individual
266	鄭開歡	Individual
267	何德明	Individual
268	鄭志雄	Fisherman
269	鄭木喜	Fisherman
270	鄭志強	Individual
271	鄭明光	Individual
272	鄭志光	Individual
273	鄭智玲	Individual
274	李芬	Individual
275	鄭志明	Fisherman
276	鄭明光	Fisherman
277	鄭木喜	Fisherman
278	陳木仔	Individual
279	羅九仔	Fisherman
280	黎美好	Fisherman
281	陳保僖	Individual
282	陳祖求	Individual
283	沈愛群	Individual
284	陳浩然	Lo So Shing Indigenous Inhabitant Representative
285	林春霖	Sok Kwu Wan Resident
286	柯蔚	Individual
287	You Chu	Lo So Shing Indigenous Inhabitant
288	Unidentified	Individual
289	陳子康	Lo So Shing Indigenous Inhabitant
290	Unidentified	Individual
291	Unidentified	Sok Kwu Wan Resident
292	Unidentified	Sok Kwu Wan Resident

No.	Name	Organization/ Individual
293	黃有帶	Sok Kwu Wan Resident
294	Unidentified	Individual
295	盧明	Sok Kwu Wan Resident
296	Unidentified	Sok Kwu Wan Resident
297	陳子謙	Lo So Shing Indigenous Inhabitant
298	郭小萍	Sok Kwu Wan Resident
299	Unidentified	Sok Kwu Wan Resident
300	Unidentified	Lo So Shing Indigenous Inhabitant
301	鍾金福	Individual
302	李英豪	Individual
303	鄭國善	Individual
304	Unidentified	Individual
305	郭榮	Individual
306	梁志強	Individual
307	Unidentified	Individual
308	梁偉楚	Individual
309	Unidentified	Individual
310	馮錦光	Individual
311	Unidentified	Individual
312	王景禮	Individual
313	Anonymous	Individual
314	李日軒	Individual
315	徐霖	Individual
316	陳光仔	Individual
317	陳一龍	Individual
318	陸志達	Individual
319	邵滿枝	Individual
320	潘家水	Individual
321	霍劍民	Sok Kwu Wan Resident
322	陳錦泉	Lo So Shing Indigenous Inhabitant
323	Chan Wai Yee	Lo So Shing Indigenous Inhabitant
324	周有娣	Lo So Shing Indigenous Inhabitant
325	陳土容	Lo So Shing Indigenous Inhabitant
326	陳禮棠	Lo So Shing Indigenous Inhabitant
327	Hai Wai Wuen	Individual
328	Chan Kam Yip	Ex-Lo So Shing Indigenous Inhabitant Representative
329	羅占科	Lo So Shing Indigenous Inhabitant
330	陳霖	Lo So Shing Indigenous Inhabitant
331	張馬蓮	Lo So Shing Indigenous Inhabitant
332	陳金發	Lo So Shing Indigenous Inhabitant
333	Mabel Lo	Individual

No.	Name	Organization/ Individual
334	羅錦榮	Individual
335	Mavis Wong	Individual
336	Christine Lo	Individual
337	盧美寶	Individual
338	周文基	Lamma Island (North) Rural Committee Member
339	周馬成	Individual
340	梁振娣	Individual
341	Unidentified	Individual
342	鄭勝才	Individual
343	WONG MING FAI	Individual
344	黃明達	Individual
345	黃禮浩	Individual
346	K Y CHUNG	Individual
347	陳通平	Lamma Island (North) Rural Committee Member
348	陳晉康	Individual
349	張惠敏	Individual
350	Nelson	Individual
351	Virginia Chan	Individual
352	Jan	Individual
353	Lucas	Individual
354	Vanessa So	Individual
355	Tun Chun Wai	Individual
356	曾啟南	Individual
357	Ken Lam	Individual
358	Mr Lau	Individual
359	Tanya	Individual
360	梁女士	Individual
361	陳俊堅	Individual
362	Peter Smith	Individual
363	W. Leung	Lamma Island Resident
364	Mike Chau	Indigenous Inhabitant
365	Ringo Yu	AES
366	Jeff Wong	Individual
367	Charlotte Varley	Individual
368	Joe Fong	Individual
369	Anonymous	Individual
370	Andy Cornish	Individual
371	Heather Dai San Martino	Business Owner Martino Design
372	周玉棠	Individual
373	陳偉明	Individual
374	Ophelia Chan	Individual

No.	Name	Organization/ Individual
375	Anonymous	Individual
376	Anonymous	Individual
377	Man Yuen Ling	Individual
378	Li Po Wa	Individual
379	劉志光	Individual
380	Chau Kwok Wah	Individual
381	Anonymous	Individual
382	Anonymous	Sok Kwu Wan Resident
383	鄭耀南	Individual
384	Anonymous	Individual
385	Vlado Vasile	Individual
386	Anonymous	Individual
387	黃蘇	Individual
388	黃明達	Individual
389	陳偉權	Individual
390	Johnny Yung	Individual
391	周先生	Individual
392	張俊聲	富記海鮮酒家
393	Angel	Individual
394	Angel	Individual
395	陳嘉欣	Individual
396	陳家駿	Individual
397	姚江龍	Lamma Island Resident
398	Anonymous	Individual
399	Unidentified	Individual
400	Lam Hok Chung	Individual
401	Stanley Chan	Individual
402	羅玉冰	Individual
403	Wong Wai Kan	Individual
404	Brian Kern	Individual
405	Christine Chester	Lamma Island Resident
406	Lee Ann	LINC
407	Mr Lo	Individual
408	Nick Berriff	Individual
409	Romain Bvsque	Individual
410	Jo Wilson	Living Lamma
411	Lucie Holicky	Living Lamma - Lamma Island Resident
412	Sheila Turner	Individual
413	Guy Lipert	Individual
414	鄭惠方	Individual
415	一群港島市民	Hong Kong Island Residents
416	姜紹輝	香港漁業聯盟 總務
417	莫毓敏	Hong Kong Resident

No.	Name	Organization/ Individual
418	Alan Sargent	Tai Wan Kau Tsuen Resident
419	Andy Cornish	Independent Ecologist
420	Ann Baldoni	Lamma Island Resident
421	Anonymous	Individual
422	B.R. Zapadmile	Yung Shue Wan Resident
423	Annabel L. Knibb	Individual
424	Catherine Macer	Pak Kok San Tsuen Resident
425	Name undisclosed	Individual
426	Carol P. Leslie	Individual
427	張正勤 Cheung Ching Kan Gisela	Lamma Island Resident
428	Chris Wright	Director of Sovereign Search
429	Christian Ross	Individual
430	Christine Ho	Lamma Island Resident
431	Claire Garner	Director of HK Shark Foundation
432	Lai, Yuen Kwan Connie	Individual
433	Coral Li	Individual
434	Daniel Clarke	Yung Shue Wan Resident
435	David Macfarlane	Lamma Island Resident / Managing Editor of Asia Asset Management / ETFI Asia
436	David Ogg	Individual
437	Denis Williamson	Tai Peng Tsuen Resident
438	Devin Hughes Wilhelm	Individual
439	Anonymous	Individual
440	Dr Laura Ruggeri	Yung Shue Long Resident
441	Dr Martin Williams	Cheung Chau Resident
442	Ed Stokes	Individual
443	Elizabeth Gower	Individual
444	Liz Gower	Individual
445	Emmy Jue	Hong Kong Resident
446	Finn & Eve Read	Hong Kong Resident
447	Fraser Douglas	Hong Kong Resident
448	Gavin Coates	Individual
449	Glen Watson	Lamma Island Resident
450	Hazel Walpole	Lamma Island Resident
451	Helena Harrison	Yung Shue Wan Resident
452	Henry Ho	Individual
453	Ho and Wong Solicitors & Notaries	on behalf of Hong Kong Nihon Cement Company Limited
454	Public Affairs Committee, Hong Kong Institute of Planners	The Hong Kong Institute of Planners
455	Hugh Farmer	Lamma Island Resident
456	Ian K Kirkby	Visitor from Australia
457	Jack Wilson	Lamma Island Resident
458	James Orr	Diversified Events Hong Kong Ltd.
459	Jane Ram	Tai Peng Tsuen Resident
460	Jeff Read	Hong Kong Resident

No.	Name	Organization/ Individual
461	Jo Wilson	Individual
462	Joanne Schmitt	Hong Kong Resident
463	Jodi Kirkby	Visitor from Australia
464	Johannes de Vries	Individual
465	John Elpinstone	White Light Ltd
466	John Horwood	Individual
467	Ecological Advisory Programme, Fauna Conservation Department, Kadoorie Farm and Botanic Garden Corporation	Kadoorie Farm and Botanic Garden Corporation
468	Karina Bergen	Lamma Island Resident
469	Kevin Laurie	Individual
470	Kim Hughes Wilhelm	Individual
471	L Kirk	Individual
472	Living Lamma	Living Lamma
473	Lee Bray	Individual
474	Lisa Genasci	CEO of The ADM Capital Foundation
475	Maria Henery	Lamma Island Resident
476	Mark Leeper	Individual
477	Martin Bode	Hong Kong Resident
478	Mathiase Kai-yan Fung	Officer for the Committee of UNEP International Million Trees (Forest) Project - for Hong Kong Region / HKGNU - Hong Kong GreenNature Union / International Committee for Affairs of Reforestation Education (I CARE) Hong Kong Division / HIMA Foundation HK
479	Mieke Franquet	Individual
480	Mr P Davis	Individual
481	Mr Sun	Individual
482	Mrs Arnauld	Yung Shue Wan Resident
483	Dr Alice Yuk, JP	Executive Vice President of YMCA of Hong Kong
484	Nick Bilcliffe	Lamma Island Resident
485	Nick Shearman	Individual
486	Nicola Nightingale	Individual
487	Nissa Marion	Hong Kong Resident
488	Norman de Brackinghe	Hong Kong Resident
489	Olga Varlamova	Visitor
490	Ophelia Chan	綠色生活推動人 / 作者 / Lamma Island Resident
491	P Williams	Individual
492	Paul Bayne	Individual
493	Paul Zimmerman	District Councillor of Pokfulam / CEO of Designing Hong Kong
494	Peter So	Individual

No.	Name	Organization/ Individual
495	Philip Farrand	Lamma Island Resident
496	Name undisclosed	Individual
497	Rachael Lucas	Yung Shue Wan Resident
498	Roberta Raine	Lamma Island Resident
499	Rosana Wong	Individual
500	Roz Keep	Yung Shue Wan Resident
501	Sally Trainor	Hong Kong Resident
502	Sarah Chapman	Hong Kong Resident
503	Shaun Clarence	Lamma Island Resident
504	Sheila McClelland	Hong Kong Resident
505	Sheila Turner	Individual
506	Sheli Bowman	Lamma Island Resident
507	Yang-Wahn Hew	Hong Kong Resident
508	Sleiman Matar	Pak Kok San Tsuen Resident
509	Sonya Yeung	Lamma Island Resident
510	Stephen Ellul	Individual
511	Steven Hirst	Individual
512	Tamara Savelyeva	Lamma Island Resident
513	Tamara Savelyeva	Lamma Island Resident
514	Tracy Read	Hong Kong Resident
515	Tsui Hiu Yue	Individual
516	Name undisclosed	Lamma Island Resident
517	Name undisclosed	Lamma Island Resident
518	Vivien Jones	Hong Kong Resident
519	Wendy Teasdill	Individual
520	Professor Bernard V. Lim, JP HKIUD	President, Hong Kong Institute of Urban Design
521	Ada Y S Fung, JP FHKIA RA	President, The Hong Kong Institute of Architects
522	Anthony Russell	Individual
523	Ms Ng	Sok Kwu Wan Resident

Appendix 15:

Photos of Stage 1 Community Engagement Activities

Community Workshop – 05/01/2013



Community Forum – 12/01/2013



Public Forum – 19/01/2013



Roving Exhibitions – 07/12/2012 to 31/01/2013



Central Pier No. 4



Aberdeen Promenade



Harbour Building, Central



Sok Kwu Wan Ferry Pier



Yung Shue Wan Ferry Pier